00001 1 2 3 4	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO	
4	EASTSIDE LINCOLN MERCURY, ET AL,)	
5	PLAINTIFFS,)	
6	VS) CASE NO: 01CV00567	
7	FORD MOTOR COMPANY, ET AL,	
8	DEFENDANTS.)	
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	DEPOSITION OF: MANUEL EUGENE MULLINS CINCINNATI, OHIO JUNE 25, 2003	
23	REPORTER: JILL M. DRAGON SANDY	
24	Dragon Reporting Service 5551 Seville Court	
25	Cincinnati, Ohio 45247 (513)574-8319	

00002 The deposition of MANUEL EUGENE MULLINS, taken on discovery, pursuant to agreement of counsel as to time and place, in the offices of Statman, Harris, Siegel & Eyrich, 2900 Chemed Center, 255 East Fifth Street, Cincinnati, Ohio, on June 25, 2003, at 10:00 AM, upon oral examination, and to 6 be used in accordance with the Ohio Rules of Civil 7 Procedure. 8 9 10 11 STIPULATIONS 12 It is stipulated by and between counsel for the representative parties that the deposition of MANUEL EUGENE 14 MULLINS, the witness herein, may be taken at this time and place pursuant to the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure, 16 pursuant to agreement of counsel as to time and place; that 17 the proof of the notary is waived; that the deposition may 18 be recorded in stenotypy by the notary public, Jill M. 19 Dragon Sandy, who is also the court reporter, and 20 transcribed out of the presence of the witness, and that the 21 deposition is required to be submitted to the witness for 22 his examination and signature. 24

25

```
00003
                          APPEARANCES
   1
   2
     FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
   3
    4 Mr. Lawrence A. Flemer
      Statman, Harris, Siegel & Eyrich
    5 2900 Chemed Center
      255 East Fifth Street
   6 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
      (513)621-2666
   7
   8
   9 FOR THE DEFENDANTS:
  10 Mr. Steven D. Hengehold
      Rendigs, Fry, Kiely & Dennis
  11 Suite 900
      One West Fourth Street
  12 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-3688
      (513)381-9221
  13
  14 Ms. Elizabeth McNellie
      Baker & Hostetler
  15 Capitol Square, Suite 2100
      65 East State Street
  16 Columbus, Ohio 43215-4260
      (614)228-1541
  17
  18
  19 ALSO PRESENT:
  20 Mr. William Woeste
  21 Mr. James Woodall
  22 Mr. Robert Reichert
  23 Mr. Christopher Armstrong
  24
  25
```

00004			
1	INDEX		
2	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY:	MR.	FLEMER
3	PAGES 5 - 33		
4	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY:	MR.	HENGEHOLD
5	PAGES 33 - 72		
6	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY:	MS.	MCNELLIE
7	PAGES 72 - 95		
8	REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY:	MR.	FLEMER
9	PAGES 95 - 116		
10			
11			
12			
13	EXHIBIT INDEX		
14	Exhibit		Page
15	Mullins 1 - Affidavit of Gene Mullins		12
16	Mullins 2 - Affidavit of Lawrence A. Flemer		14
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

00005 1 MANUEL EUGENE MULLINS, 2 called on behalf of the Plaintiff, after having been 3 first duly sworn, was examined and deposed as follows: 4 DIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MR. FLEMER: Mr. Mullins, I'm Larry Flemer, and we 6 7 met briefly before the beginning of your deposition. I 8 represent the plaintiffs in a lawsuit that has been filed in the District Court here in southern Ohio, styled Eastside 10 Lincoln Mercury and others versus Ford Motor Company and others, and you are here today pursuant to a subpoena which I had issued by the Court, following some conversations and communications between us, and relative to your appearance 14 as a witness in the case. 15 I don't know if you've ever had a 16 deposition taken before, but there are a couple of ground 17 rules that I'll go over with you, so that you understand the 18 process. 19 The first one is that it's important for 20 you give a verbal answer to any questions that are asked of 21 you. 22 The second is that if you don't 23 understand, at least any questions I ask, and I'm sure this 24 applies for anybody here in the room who would ask you 25 questions, is to please ask for clarification or for

00006	
1	rephrasing of the question so that you are clear on what's
2	being asked of you.
3	Thirdly, if you need to take a break at
4	any time, let us know and we'll accommodate you. Okay?
5	A. Sure.
6	Q. Would you state your full name, please?
7	A. Manuel Eugene Mullins.
8	Q. Is it Emmanuel?
9	A. Manuel.
10	Q. Manuel, okay.
11	And what is your address?
12	A. 1698 Fairside Court, that's in Florence,
13	Kentucky, 41042, if that's
14	Q. And how long have you lived at that
15	address?
16	A. One year.
17	Q. Are you employed?
18	A. I'm employed, yes.
19	Q. Who do you work for?
20	A. I work for National Liberty Mortgage.
21	Q. And what is your business address?
22	A. 7368 Liberty One Drive, and that's in
23	Liberty Township, Ohio.
24	Q. You're in Mason?
25	A. I think it's technically Middletown.
	-

00007	
1	Middletown is 45044. I guess that's the name of the area.
2	Q . And how long have you been employed by
3	National Liberty Mortgage?
4	A. Oh, since December of '02.
5	Q. And what position do you hold with
6	National Liberty?
7	A. I'm a mortgage broker, loan officer,
8	mortgage broker.
9	Q. Prior to your employment with National
10	Liberty Mortgage, did you previously work for the Kenwood
11	Dealer Group?
12	A. Yes.
13	Q. What period much time did you work for
14	them?
15	A. April of well, Kenwood Dealer Group
16	specifically, or Northgate Lincoln Mercury?
17	Q. Why don't we talk about Northgate
18	Lincoln Mercury? I understand that you were employed there
19	for a period of time.
20	A. Right, it was from April, on about
21	April the 1st of '96, to about April, the same month, of
22	'01 excuse me, '02.
23	Q. And what position or positions did you
24	hold with Northgate Lincoln Mercury?
25	A. The only position I had there was

00008

4

5

1 general sales manager. Well, I take that back. About a 2 week before my dismissal there, I was demoted to new car 3 manager.

- Q. And you mentioned that you were dismissed from employment. What were the circumstances of dismissal from your employment there?
- A. Well, ostensively, it was because I was meddling with one of our other employees which was accused 9 of recruiting one of the employees for one of the other 10 dealerships, and --
- 11 Q. Is that the reason that was given to you 12 for your termination?
- A. That was the ostensive reason. It was told to me by my superior, Jerry Mullins, the reason for my dismissal is, "this particular issue had once again resurfaced and has cost you your job" was his quote, I think.
- Q. And what was the stated reason or how was it connected with meddling with another employee?

 A. The company's policy was really not to recruit salespeople from other dealerships. Although it was a widely practiced thing, still it was something that was taboo. You weren't supposed to call Joe, who was the top salesman at, you know, one other dealership, whoever, and try to get them to come to work for your firm, just to keep

00009 people in their positions. Q. Are you referring to other dealerships 3 that were part of the Kenwood Dealer Group? 4 A. Yes, within our own group, yes. 5 Q. And what were those other dealerships, 6 what were the names of those other dealerships? 7 Well, there was -- the one particular Α. 8 instance here that I'm talking about is the Saturn of 9 Beechmont. There was a woman salesperson there, I don't 10 really recall her name right now, but she was the one, 11 supposedly. 12 And this individual, the salesperson Q. 13 from Saturn of Beechmont, was the person that you were allegedly trying to recruit? 14 15 Α. 16 Okay. And Saturn of Beechmont was one Q. 17 of the group --18 One of the Kenwood Dealer Group, Α. 19 Mr. Reichert's organization. 20 Q. And was there any investigation or 21 anything done to substantiate this charge against you? 22 A. No, it was just, you know, pretty much 23 it was already, the decision was already made by either 24 Jerry Mullins or, you know, someone else, to send me down 25 the road.

00010	
1	Q. And was there a time previous to this
2	when you were accused of the same recruiting violation?
3	A. No, no.
4	Q. I think you testified earlier that the
5	comment was made to you by Jerry Mullins that, once again,
6	you were being accused of something?
7	A. Well, he said we had talked about
8	that. I wasn't accused at the time previous. We had talked
9	about that issue before, you know. And Jerry, in fact, on
10	occasion, would encourage the recruiting of this guy or that
11	guy or whatever, but to be careful with it, you know, just
12	don't so what I did in that particular case, she was
13	actually calling one of my salespeople and trying to
14	communicate to me, you know, through him, and what I did was
15	informed her, point blank, to talk with her general manager,
16	and if she had the blessing of him, then we'd be happy to
17	talk to her, and I left it at that. And not until after I
18	was dismissed did I kind of put the stuff together and
19	think, yeah, that was a farce, it was a charade, you know,
20	that he had trumped up, for whatever, you know, expedient
21	reasons of his own, to, you know, send Gene Mullins down the
22	road.
23	Q. And you're referring to Jerry Mullins?
24	A. Yeah, Jerry Mullins.
25	O. And what was Jerry Mullins' position?

00011 A. He was the general manager of Mr. Reichert's store, which is, in effect, a dealer 3 principal. And he was the general manager of 4 Q. 5 Northqate Lincoln Mercury? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Q. Was he your direct report? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Okay. Mr. Mullins, I want you to be Q. 10 aware that I issued a subpoena for you in this case in 11 conjunction with a motion that our office prepared and filed with the Court, relative to communications that I had with 13 you and you had with me about being a witness and signing an 14 affidavit in the case. 15 Α. 16 And following the filing of a motion Ο. 17 with the Court, the Court issued an order expressing the 18 Court's view that the proper thing to do would be to have 19 your deposition and find out a little bit more about what 20 was going on with respect to your willingness to sign an 21 affidavit that we had drafted and exchanged and sent to you to be reviewed and signed. The subpoena that -- and I think you 24 brought your subpoena with you today, if I'm not mistaken; 25 is that correct?

00012 1 Α. Yes. Q. It was served upon you on June the 8th 3 of this year; is that right? Α. Yes. 5 Q. At your residence address? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Okay. And it commanded you to be here Q. 8 today for the purpose of getting a deposition. 9 Prior to receiving the subpoena, is it 10 accurate, sir, that you and I had several phone 11 conversations and exchanged some e-mails relative to an 12 affidavit? 13 Yeah. Α. 14 Okay. What I'd like to do -- and also, Q. 15 before we start today, I gave you a copy of the affidavit, which I guess I'll refer to in the deposition as your signed 17 affidavit. The document that you have before you is, in 18 fact, a copy of the affidavit that you signed on May the 19 20th; is that correct? 20 Α. That's correct. 21 I'm going to have the court reporter Q. 22 mark -- would you mind if she marked the copy that I gave 23 you, and then I have some others that we can hand out to 24 other counsel? 25 (THEREUPON, MULLINS EXHIBIT NO. 1 WAS

00013 1 MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION). Q. Mr. Mullins, the court reporter has now marked, as Mullins Exhibit 1, your signed affidavit. Would you just take a second and look at that and verify that that is, in fact, an accurate copy of the document that you sent back to me after signing it on May the 20th of 2003? 7 Α. Yes, it is. 8 Q. And prior to starting your testimony 9 today, did you have a chance to look that over? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Okay. 12 Α. In fact, I edited, not this one, but you 13 and I have exchanged e-mails and I've edited a few things, after reflection, you know, that just needed to be 15 corrected. 16 Right, and we'll talk about some of Q. 17 those earlier drafts of this document, but this is the final 18 document which you signed? 19 Α. 20 Ο. And is it accurate to state, sir, that 21 the content of this affidavit is true and correct, to the 22 best of your knowledge? 23 To the best of my knowledge, it's Α. 24 factual.

Okay. Let's talk a little bit about the

Q.

25

00014 chronology of events that got to where we are today. In conjunction with a motion that I filed with the Court, I submitted my own affidavit, which had a number of attachments to it, and part of what the affidavit that I wrote was designed to do was to set out the chronology of events and communications between us. And I'm 7 going to -- counsel has already been served with copies of this, but I'm going to refer to this (indicating), and it's already been filed with the Court but I guess we can mark 10 this as Mullins 2. I'm going to refer to this and just ask 11 you to address whether I've got the chronology right from some of our discussions. Okay? 13 (THEREUPON, MULLINS EXHIBIT NO. 2 WAS 14 MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION). Mr. Mullins, the court reporter has now 15 Q. 16 marked, as Mullins Exhibit 2, my affidavit, and I'm just 17 going to go through a couple of the dates to try to give a chronology here, but if you would take a few minute before I 19 do that to just read over the first three pages. 20 (Witness complies). Α. 21 Did you have an opportunity to look over Q. 22 my affidavit and the attachments? 23 Α. Yes. 2.4 Okay. For the purposes of these next Q. 25 several questions, I'm just going to try to hit some dates

00015 and put in a time frame our discussions. To your recollection, sir, is it true 3 that around the middle of April, you and I first had a phone conversation, and I called you after you had spoken with Mr. Woeste; is that correct? 6 Α. Right. 7 And sometime prior to April 16 of this Q. 8 past spring, you had contacted Mr. Woeste and indicated that 9 you had some information that might pertain to this lawsuit; 10 is that right? 11 Right. Α. 12 And you did that on your own initiative; Q. 13 is that correct? 14 Yes. Α. 15 Q. And then following your message to 16 Mr. Woeste, I then called you and interviewed you on or 17 about April the 16th; is that true? 18 That's correct, that's correct. Α. 19 And that interview was on a telephone Q. 20 call; is that correct? 21 That's right. Α. Okay. And following that interview, it 22 Q. 23 was agreed that you would meet with Mr. Woeste, face to 24 face, and have a discussion with him about what you knew in 25 connection with some of the issues in the case; is that

00016		
1	right?	
2	A. That's right.	
3	Q. And did you, in fact, meet with	
4	Mr. Woeste, I think at a lunch?	
5	A. We had lunch, yes.	
6	Q. Around April the 18th of 2003?	
7	A. Yes.	
8	Q. And then following that meeting, did I	
9	then call you another time and we talked further about your	
10	discussions with Mr. Woeste and some specific information	
11	that you had shared with him?	
12	A. Yes.	
13	Q. Okay. And at that time, did I suggest	
14	that what we would want to do with your information was put	
15	it in writing?	
16	A. Yes.	
17	Q. Okay. And you agreed that that would	
18	be you would be willing to do so at that time?	
19	A. Yeah.	
20	Q. Okay. Is it also correct, Mr. Mullins,	
21	that towards the end of April, I had further discussions	
22	with you and I e-mailed a draft affidavit to you for your	
23	review?	
24	A. Yes. Yes, sir.	
25	Q. Okay. And did you receive that sometime	

00017 towards the end of April of 2003, to the best of your recollection? 3 I think so, yes. Α. 4 And after receiving the document that I Q. 5 sent to you via e-mail, did you make some changes to it? 6 Α. Yes, I did. 7 Corrections or insertions with dates and Q. 8 things of that nature? 9 Α. Yeah, some minor adjustments that needed 10 to be made. And I don't have the -- you may have the 11 highlighted parts, I don't have them in front of me. 12 Right. Q. 13 Attached to Mullins Exhibit 2 were a 14 number of exhibits, some of which I think you would have knowledge of or at least could identify, but Exhibit A to my 15 affidavit, if you can find that, is something I printed off 17 at my computer which reflects that you had sent me an e-mail 18 on April the 29th at about 7:19 PM entitled "affidavit edited." Do you recall returning the draft that I sent to 20 you with some changes --21 Yes, I do. Α. 22 -- on April the 29th at about 7:19 PM? Q. 23 Α. Yes. 2.4 Okay. And the copy that -- or the Q. 25 document that you returned to me in the edited fashion had

00018 some changes made that showed up in red when I printed it. Do you recall having a program on your computer where you 3 could --4 Yeah, Microsoft Word has the ability to Α. 5 highlight specific areas of text that -- for attention 6 purposes. 7 Q. Okay. And you used that feature to highlight new text that you were putting in to correct or 8 9 supplement the affidavit that I sent to you? 10 Α. That's correct. 11 Is that right? Q. 12 Yes. Α. 13 Q. What I have here, Mr. Mullins, is a copy of the highlighted affidavit, which was also filed with the 15 Court. I'm just going to show this to you but not mark it, because what happened is that, when I photocopied Mullins 17 Exhibit 2 today, it didn't show up in red, of course, 18 because it just went through the copier with black toner. 19 Α. Uh-huh. 20 But the document that was attached to Ο. 21 the affidavit I filed with the court and served on all counsel did have the red printing in it. Would you take a moment and compare the 24 exhibit that was attached to my affidavit and filed with the 25 court to the one that is stated as Exhibit --

00019 1 Α. This one (indicating)? -- Exhibit A, I think? Yeah. 2 Q. 3 Let's do it this way: You have before you Mullins Exhibit 2 to your deposition, which has the e-mail cover on it, and then beneath that is a copy of your affidavit. And if you could, just go through there and 7 confirm that the sections that are highlighted in red on the document that I took out of my pleadings binder are, in fact, contained in this exhibit, just so -- and confirm that 10 those are the same document. 11 Yes, that's the same. Α. 12 Okay. And the next thing that happened Q. 13 where you and I had communication was that I made the changes on the affidavit per your highlighting, and then I called you, if you recall, to get your home address, so I could print it and mail it to you; is that correct? 17 Α. That's correct. 18 And according to my notes, we had a Q. 19 discussion or you left me a voice mail with your home address on May the 7th of 2003; is that correct? 21 That's correct, yes, sir. Α. 22 Okay. And when you left me a message Q. 23 with your home address, I think I transcribed that message 24 and made it an exhibit to my affidavit. Would you look at

25 Exhibit C to Mullins Exhibit 2?

00020 1 Α. Okay. 2 Q. Exhibit C is the transcription of a 3 voice mail that you left for me on May the 7th at 3:44 PM. Is that an accurate transcription of the message you left 5 that day? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Q. And at that point in time, the process 8 was such that I was going to send you the affidavit to your 9 home address, you would review it one final time, sign it 10 and send it back to me; is that right? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. And that was your intention as of that 13 date? 14 Yes, it was. Α. 15 And Exhibit D to Mullins depo Exhibit 2 Q. 16 is a letter that I used to forward the affidavit to you 17 dated May the 8th. Did you receive that letter in the mail, 18 on or about May 9th or 10th? 19 Yes. Α. 20 Ο. And included in with that letter was a 21 copy of your affidavit, was it not? 22 Yes, it was. Α. 23 And Exhibit E to Mullins depo Exhibit 2 Q. 24 is, in fact, a copy of your affidavit; is that correct? 25 Α. That's correct.

00021 Okay. And does Exhibit E have the changes that you had asked or suggested be made to the 3 document? 4 Yes. Yes, it does. Α. 5 Okay. And I think the only thing I'm 6 aware of that changed between the earlier version that was 7 sent to you and the document marked Exhibit E is in Paragraph 11, the very last sentence of that paragraph, which states, "these additional monies were unavailable to 10 the other dealers in our area." The prior version had a 11 period after the word "area," and in one of our phone 12 conversations I asked you how you knew that and you said 13 that was according to Pat Letart. 14 That's correct. Α. 15 So I added that phrase, "according to Q. 16 Mr. Letart, "right? 17 Α. That's right. 18 That would make that statement accurate Q. 19 and complete, as per the document that's identified as 20 Exhibit E; is that right? 21 That's correct, yes. Α. 22 Okay. And you would have received the Q. 23 final document for signature a couple of days after my 24 letter dated May the 8th; is that right? 25 Α. That's correct.

00022 Okay. And then on May the 13th, you left me a voice mail after the close of business that day which I had transcribed and made Exhibit F to my affidavit. Do you see that transcription there? 5 Α. Yes, I do. 6 Ο. And as you review that, is an accurate 7 transcription of the message that you left for me? 8 A. It looks accurate, yes. 9 Q. All right. And following my receipt of 10 your voice mail, I called you on May the 14th and left you a 11 voice mail asking you to contact me, because, after 12 reviewing your voice mail, obviously I had some questions with respect to what you told me in your voice mail and 14 asked that you call me. 15 Α. Correct. 16 Do you recall receiving a voice mail Ο. 17 from me on May the 14th? 18 Α. Yes, I do. 19 And then I sent the letter dated May the Q. 20 14th, confirming that I was asking you to call me. 21 Right. Α. 22 Q. Did you receive that letter on or about 23 May the 15th or 16th? 24 Α. Yes. 25 Q. And am I correct, sir, that, despite my

00023

4

7

8

9

11

12

voice mail and despite my letter, you did not contact me at that point in time?

- Α. That's correct.
- Okay. Subsequently, we, as I told you Q. earlier, filed the papers with the Court, and I prepared my affidavit, which you've been reviewing, on May the 20th, and filed that. And as I indicated, the Court issued an order suggesting that the next step should be that we take your deposition.
- 10 Α. Okay.
 - Could you tell us what transpired Q. between the time when you were willing to sign the affidavit and the time that you left me the voice mail on the evening of May the 13th, indicating that you had changed your mind
- and were not willing to sign the affidavit at that point? 15 16 Sure. What transpired, aside from my Α. 17 own internal thoughts, was I spoke with my wife on a number 18 of occasions about, you know, this particular issue, and she 19 had suggested to me to get over it, you know, forget about it, move on, which I had pretty much done, but -- and as my 21 voice message states here (indicating), you know, there's no 22 real upside in it for Gene Mullins about these particular issues here, other than maybe revenge, you know, for a 24 wrongful dismissal. Those are the thought processes that
- 25 goes through ones head.

00024

In previous conversations with Mr. Reichert, calling my home on issues that are not really germane to this litigation here, he had threatened me, in no uncertain terms, with legal action if I continued, you know, whatever he had accused me of doing, planting an e-mail 6 virus I think was his reasoning for the call, which was 7 unfounded, but, nevertheless, he threatened me with legal action and threatened to go to the Hamilton County Prosecutor to prohibit my, whatever, you know, sending 10 viruses in the e-mail, which I did not do, and I told him 11 so. And he had threatened me a couple of times with legal action and those thoughts were in my head about, well, you know, Bob Reichert is a smart guy, he's not going to, you 14 know, he can -- he's an attorney and, you know, he can litigate pretty easily, pretty cheaply, although I'm sure he's not going to do it on his own, but he has his hired 17 guns. And my previous contacts with attorneys have been 18 less than positive. So, you know, if you win, you lose, that was my reasoning for that. So I thought, you know 20 what, I don't want to -- there's no upside in me -- I'm done 21 with the organization, I don't want to be associated with 22 the organization any longer. I gave them 100 percent of my 23 efforts and for that I got screwed. So, that's about it, 24 you know, I made the decision that screw it, there's no 25 upside in it for me.

00025 And I'm not looking for an upside, I wasn't looking for any, you know, pay or any fee or any monies for this, you know, information, but I felt that, you 4 know, Mr. Reichert's organization had a couple of people in it that had done me wrong and, you know, their image of -the Bow Peep image that they had projected was less than 7 that and I let it be known. 8 And, you know, after thinking about 9 that, I thought, you know what, I don't really want to go 10 through this litigation process. You know, I end up with a 11 \$20,000 legal bill and, you know, it's just not worth it. 12 So, at that point, I think you took that to mean that I was threatened directly with regard to this, these issues, when I was alluding to previous threats Mr. Reichert made to me, you know, regarding other issues, after my departure from 16 the firm. 17 Q. From Northgate Lincoln Mercury? 18 Α. 19 Okay. No, I didn't know --Q. 20 Yeah, well, we didn't have a Α. 21 conversation after that. 22 Right, we didn't have a conversation, I Q. 23 just had the voice mail. And your voice mail stated what's 24 here in Exhibit F. 25 Α. Uh-huh.

00026	
1	Q. And it didn't elaborate on when the
2	threats were made.
3	A. Right.
4	Q. And I was trying to find out
5	A. Exactly.
6	Q what had happened.
7	A. And I wouldn't return your calls. I
8	wasn't interested in it. I was hoping you would go away,
9	leave me alone, and I could move on with it. So that was
10	the reasoning for it.
11	Q. So when you were leaving me a voice mail
12	on May the 13th, your reference to being threatened with
13	legal action was in conjunction with communications that you
14	and Mr. Reichert had had prior to any discussions with us
15	about the lawsuit
16	A. Exactly.
17	Q involving Mr. Woeste's dealership?
18	A. Exactly.
19	Q. And let me just be clear, has
20	Mr. Reichert, or anyone that works for him, contacted you
21	with respect to any issues involving the Eastside Lincoln
22	Mercury case?
23	A. No, I've had no contact.
24	Q. Or since the Eastside Lincoln Mercury
25	case came out?

00027	
1	A. No. They're smart enough, I think, not
2	to do that.
3	Q. Okay. Has anybody from Ford Motor
4	Company contacted you
5	A. No.
6	Q with respect to the issues or your
7	appearance as a witness in the Eastside Lincoln Mercury
8	case?
9	A. No.
10	Q. When did you have your discussions with
11	Mr. Reichert where he accused you of sending an e-mail virus
12	or something like that?
13	A. (No response).
14	Q. You said you were terminated in April of
15	'03?
16	A. No.
17	Q. I'm sorry, that's not right.
18 19	A. I don't have the exact date, but I would
20	think it's probably on or about February, maybe, of '02, maybe March.
21	Q. You left in April of '02, according to
22	your affidavit.
23	A. I'm sorry, '03.
24	Q. All right. So it would have been
25	February or March of the current year?

00028	
1	A. I think so. As I said, I don't
2	Q. Well, it was after you left?
3	A. Yes, it was.
4	Q. So it couldn't have been February of
5	'02, because you were still there?
6	A. Right, right.
7	Q. So it would have been this past
8	February?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. And did Mr. Reichert call you at home
11	or
12	A. Yes, he did.
13	Q. How many times did that happen?
14	A. I think he just called me once at home.
15	He called me and left a message at my home, "Gene, we need
16	to talk," I think was his verbatim message.
17	Q. And did you call him back?
18	A. Yes, I did. Yeah, I did call him back.
19	Q. And what was the content of that
20	conversation, as best you can recall?
21	A. He had well, I think he had gotten
22	information from Jerry Mullins, who had accused me of
23	planting an e-mail virus on the company computer somehow,
24	from afar, and
25	Q. After you had left the company?

00029 Yeah, yeah. 1 Α. Q. Go ahead. 3 Α. Anyway, and then, you know, I told Mr. Reichert, I said, you know, Bob, I didn't plant it. 5 he, you know, was convinced by his subordinates that I did it, and he threatened going to the Hamilton County 7 Prosecutor and so forth. And I told him, I said, you know, I'm not intimidated by your threats, because I knew I didn't do it. So I tried to explain to him that this was a virus 10 that's on Zoom Town DSL network that's really ubiquitous in 11 the area. Zoom Town knows it's a problem. I've gotten 12 e-mails from people within his organization, however, I had the computer acumen to know that, you know, it wasn't sent 14 by one of his subordinates, and I wasn't calling him up, you know, crying to him that someone ruined my hard drive. I knew it was unfounded. And he just continued to do it, turn 17 me over to the Hamilton County Prosecutor and whatever, 18 so --19 Did you have more than just one Q. 20 conversation with Mr. Reichert since you left his 21 employment? 22 Well, my contact with him has been 23 pretty much nill, other than that conversation there. I was 24 trying to recall if there was one prior to that. 25 Q. Or one subsequent?

00030 1 Α. No. Q. Were there any written communications 3 you had with Mr. Reichert, or anybody on his behalf? Not germane to these issues here. After Α. my dismissal from the firm, I had sent him a couple of letters, you know, explaining my position. 7 When you were reflecting on whether to Q. 8 sign the affidavit which we've marked as an Exhibit here to your deposition, Mullins Exhibit 1, was your thought process 10 one where you thought, well, if Mr. Reichert has already 11 threatened me with legal action in connection with this e-mail virus, he's likely to do it again if I get involved 13 in this lawsuit? 14 Well, that was the whole point of this Α. 15 The message that I left was, you know, I conversation here. still had -- although I guess I was intimidated by his 17 threats of legal action, you know, but --18 Q. So that was in your mind when you left 19 me the voice mail that's marked as Exhibit F; is that right? 20 Yes, right. I didn't mean to indicate Α. 21 that they had -- I noticed that, you know, somewhere in this paperwork here (indicating), that it was alluded to, perhaps, that someone had called me from their organization, 24 which was not the case. These were my thought processes, 25 you know, my fears that there's going to be some litigation

00031				
1	here, and that was my wife's fears as well, you know, that			
2	you don't want to get in bed with a lawyer.			
3	Q. But am I accurate in stating that your			
4	fear, as expressed on Ma	fear, as expressed on May the 13th in this voice mail, was		
5	based on the threats tha	based on the threats that Mr. Reichert had made to you a		
6	couple of months earlier	?		
7	A. Yes.			
8	Q. And	you still had that fear in your head		
9	in May?			
10	A. Yes.			
11		though you hadn't had any further		
12	communication with Mr. Reichert at that point in time?			
13	5	t, right.		
14	Q. Okay	. After the subpoena was served on		
15	you on or about May the 20th, then you signed the affidavit			
16	and sent it back to me;	correct?		
17		's correct.		
18	~	what was it that made you decide to		
19				
20		s commanded by this person here		
21	(indicating).			
22	~	re referring to the subpoena?		
23	A. Yeah			
24	Q. Okay			
25	A. Othe	than that, I thought, well, you		

00032 know, I'll just send them that. It was all factual, you know, per our discussions. I'll just send it and I thought, well, maybe they'll go away (indicating). All right. Is it accurate, Mr. Mullins, Ο. 5 that there is nothing contained in your affidavit marked as 6 Mullins Exhibit 1 that is anything other than true and accurate; is that true? 7 8 Α. Absolutely. And other than our brief conversation in 9 Q. 10 our lobby before the deposition started this morning, in 11 which you indicated that you didn't have a copy of your affidavit and I gave you one to look at, have you and I had 13 any other communication? 14 Α. No. 15 Either e-mail or telephone or the like? Q. 16 Α. 17 I guess the only other thing that I Ο. 18 would ask at this point is: Does your affidavit, Mullins Exhibit 1, also accurately reflect what you told Mr. Woeste 20 when you met with him for lunch that day? 21 Yeah. Oh, yeah, it's accurate. You Α. 22 know, not verbatim, obviously, but it is accurate. The content of it is as accurate in its O. 24 written form as it was when you spoke to Mr. Woeste over

25

lunch?

00033 1 Α. That's correct, right. 2 MR. FLEMER: Okay. I don't have any 3 further questions, Mr. Mullins, thank you. 4 MS. MCNELLIE: Can we take a break? 5 (THEREUPON, A SHORT RECESS WAS TAKEN). 6 CROSS-EXAMINATION 7 BY MR. HENGEHOLD: 8 Q. Mr. Mullins, my name is Steve Hengehold. 9 I'm an attorney with Rendigs, Fry, Kiely and Dennis, and our 10 firm represents the Kenwood Dealer Group and Bob Reichert in 11 the case pending in Federal Court, which is the matter through which you were subpoenaed here today. And I have a few questions to follow-up a little bit on the questioning of Mr. Flemer, and then more particularly to question you about the areas in which Mr. Flemer's firm has identified 16 that you will testify. 17 The first item indicated in what was 18 originally disclosed for your testimony is identified as the 19 preferential allocation of vehicles to KDG and reduction of 20 ELM's vehicle allocation. Can you tell me, Mr. Mullins, and I don't believe that -- I'm not reading that off of your 22 affidavit, I'm reading that off of a pleading that was filed 23 with the Court that you probably haven't seen. Do you have 24 any specific knowledge as to vehicles being preferentially 25 allocated to the Kenwood Dealer Group by Ford Motor Company?

00034	
1	A. Do I have any specific knowledge?
2	Q. Yes, can you identify an allocation, a
3	group of vehicles, an individual vehicle, that you believe
4	was allocated to the Kenwood Dealer Group dealerships by
5	Ford Motor Company that was preferential?
6	A. Can I identify a specific lot of
7	vehicles that was sent to us, do I have documentation for
8	it, no.
9	Q. You sort of gave me and you probably
10	answered the question and perhaps my next question.
11	There's no specific lot of vehicles that
12	you can testify to today, nor do you have any documentation
13	as to any specific lot or vehicle?
14	A. I don't have any documentation that
15	obviously will confirm. My affidavit states, or my
16	testimony was that, you know, if I knew of specific vehicles
17	that were allocated to us on a preferential basis. Specific
18	lots, do I have them, this car, those serial numbers, no.
19	Q. Can you describe a preferential
20	allocation by model?
21	A. Lincolns and Grand Marquis.
22	Q. Okay. What model of Lincoln?
23	A. Town Cars, mostly. Those were the only
24	Lincolns that were really, you know, a factor in the market.
25	I mean the Town Cars were the only Lincoln, other than maybe

00035 the Navigator, that anybody actually even wanted. Q. Okay. So your information about preferential allocation would deal with Lincoln Town Cars and Mercury Grand Marquis? 5 Α. That's correct. 6 Q. What time frame? 7 Well, I'd have to go back and check my Α. 8 notes, but, you know, we were allocated approximately, maybe 9 40 or 50 extra Lincolns and Grand Marquis, not just our 10 specific dealership but his other store, Lincoln Mercury of 11 Kings Auto Mall, and I'm thinking these were 2000 models. 12 When you say 40 or 50, is that 40 or 50 Q. 13 of each or 40 or 50 total? There's two, as I understand it, we're talking about two different cars, the Town Car and the 15 Grand Marquis; right? 16 Right, 40 or 50 of each. Α. 17 Okay. Now I know that the 2000 model Q. 18 year doesn't necessarily mean the year 2000, or any 19 particular time. Do you have a better idea or can you give 20 me a more specific --21 As specific as I can get without going Α. 22 over some data that, you know, one of these other people 23 could supply, would be in the sell-out season, which would 24 be the summer selling season, as we refer to it, or the 25 close-out season, which is typically from, I would say July

00036 1 through September. Q. July through September, is that both the sell-out season and the close-out season, those are two terms for the same time frame? 5 Α. 6 Ο. And it's your recollection that -- in 7 what year would that be, 2000? 8 A. I think it would be 2000. 9 Q. So, between July and September of 2000, 10 it's your recollection that all of the Kenwood Dealer Group 11 Mercury dealerships and Lincoln dealerships received 40 to 50 Town Cars and 40 to 50 Grand Marquis, in addition to 13 their regular -- or their in addition to their allotment? 14 I would say, my statement would be, in Α. 15 the aggregate, we got an additional 40 or 50 of each of those vehicle lines to be dispersed amongst the three 17 dealerships that the gentlemen owned. 18 So if there are three dealerships, one Q. 19 might have gotten 15, another got 15 and the other ten, if 20 40 was the number; correct? 21 Right, correct. The largest volume Α. 22 store would obviously get the bulk of the inventory, and we 23 were instructed by our general managers, at least I was, 24 that we could pick and choose, at random, between their

25 inventories, and vice versa.

00037 Q. The inventories of all of the Kenwood Dealer Group Lincoln Mercury dealerships? 3 Α. Yes. Now, you referenced a few minutes ago, 4 Q. 5 in one of my earlier questions, you said, "without reviewing my notes". What kind of notes do you have? 7 Mental notes is what I have. I would Α. 8 review my mental notes, any mental notes that I make. If I 9 had copies of the allocation reports from the district and 10 from, you know, within our organization. 11 What was the, if you can recall, the Q. 12 number of Town Cars that were to be allotted, 13 non-preferentially, during this time frame? 14 Non-preferentially, we would get 15 typically enough cars to last us through what our daily selling rate -- to match our daily selling rate, or our 17 monthly averages over a period of time. The district -- Pat 18 Letart would come and sit down with me and say, "these are the vehicles that you sold last time, the market is as such 20 now, so we're going to allocate to you these vehicles, based on empirical data. In addition to that, we were allocated other vehicles, 40 to 50, or thereabouts, as I mentioned. My question -- or more specifically, Q. 24 over this July to September time frame, which is where we've 25 bracketed the 40 to 50 vehicles of each model, how many

00038 would the dealership receive pursuant to non-preferential allotment during those three months, of these models? Α. On the Lincolns, we would normally get -- well, it's also subject to what your current 4 inventory is, if you have a current inventory. We're allocated a certain amount of cars, but allocating just 7 means that, you know, these are the numbers that we've picked for you, do you concur with these numbers or what numbers do you have on your own. So therein lies the 10 process, dealing back and forth with the factory managers, 11 negotiating with them. 12 We would normally be allocated, to 13 answer your question, you're looking for a number and I'm going to try to give you the best guesstimate that I can without, you know, looking at hard facts of what our 15 inventory was in that period, and I can't answer it exactly, 17 no more than you can answer me how much was in your checking 18 account on that day, you know, in time, because it's not a number that's some milestone in my head, so, given that, you 20 know, we would normally get, to answer it broadly, we would 21 normally get maybe five Town Cars per month, and maybe we would normally get maybe ten Grand Marquis or 12 Grand Marquis per month. 23 2.4 Is that Northgate?

Northgate, our store. I can speak to

Q.

Α.

25

00039 1 our store. Q. How many would the Kenwood Dealer Group 3 get in total? 4 Well, I can only offer an educated guess Α. 5 to that. Mr. Reichert could probably better answer that. 6 Q. Well, here's what I'm trying to do: You 7 testified that they got 40 to 50 additional Town Cars in this three-month period, an additional allotment. 8 9 Α. Okay. 10 Q. And I'm trying to compare that number 11 with what they got in their non-preferential allotment. So, however, whatever mental notes you refer to or whatever calculations, however rough they might be, to come up with the 40 to 50 number, I'm trying to compare that with the 15 regular number to see what the additional inventory was. 16 Okay. Well, as I stated, we would get Α. 17 Grand Marquis, typically, over a three-month period, they 18 would space them out over a three or four-month period depending on what the factory's schedule was, the production schedules, so we would, our store, which would be Northgate Lincoln Mercury, would get 15 Town Cars, or thereabouts, allocated to us over that three-month period, and we would 23 get 45, maybe, Grand Marquis over that particular period. 2.4 Q. Of the 40 or 50 additional allotment 25 that was provided, or the preferential allotment, how many

00040

18 locations.

of those vehicles were housed on the Northgate Lincoln Mercury lot?

3 Those cars don't come in all at one Α. 4 time. You must understand, they come in -- they're 5 distributed on a monthly basis. So, you know, it's not like, hey, here's 40 cars. And we had space problems at 7 Northgate Lincoln Mercury. We couldn't -- we would have to store them. We had so many cars that we had to store them at other locations. We had to store them at Chuck E. 10 Cheese, across the street. We had to store them at a -- we 11 had a satellite used car operation at Northgate, so we had 12 to store the new cars, we had so many that we had to store 13 new Lincolns and new Mercuries up there, at the separate 14 location. So we were swollen with inventory. We had to --15 we used space, for awhile, across the street at Joseph's 16 organization, and then when that got wore out, our welcome 17 there, you know, then they put cars up at the other

Q. But the preferential allotment of Town Cars and Grand Marquis, do you have any idea, as you sit here today, how many of those were sold through your dealership?

A. How many of the vehicles that we were allotted preferentially were sold through our store, is that your question?

00041	
1	Q. Yes.
2	A. I can give you an estimate. Is that
3	what you're looking for?
4	Q. Only if you have some facts upon which
5	you'll base your estimate. I don't want you to simply pick
6	a number.
7	A. Well, you know, I can return with some,
8	you know, spreadsheets. I have some spreadsheets on my
9	computer where I compiled, you know, the types of cars that
10	we sold over a five-year, you know, four or five-year time
11	frame in Microsoft Excel. I could find the make and model
12	of each car that was sold by our store. I mean, if you want
13	that data, I can get it. I don't have it with me,
14	obviously, but I could refer back to it.
15	Q. Okay. Do you have any knowledge of what
16	other Lincoln Mercury dealerships in the Cincinnati market
17	were allotted during the sell-out/close-out season?
18	A. Well, I was told by my general manager,
19	and also one of the shareholders of Mr. Reichert's firm,
20	Larry Feldhaus, that the other dealers weren't going to get
21	a whole lot of automobiles, they were going to get very few
22	cars.
23	Q. And
24	A. Given their go ahead, I'm sorry.
25	O The few care that you understood them to

00042 be referring to are these preferential allotments. Α. Yes. 3 Okay. Q. 4 Well, I understood them to be few cars Α. 5 in general, not few cars preferentially dispersed, but --6 Ο. Do you have any information other than 7 what you were told by Mr. Mullins and Mr. Feldhaus, 8 concerning the allotment of vehicles to other non-Kenwood Dealer Group Lincoln Mercury dealerships? 9 10 Well, it was, you know, Mr. Pat Letart, Α. 11 which at that point in time was the district manager, and he would come in peddling his cars to us. That indicated to me that, you know, because of the practices of Eastside Lincoln Mercury, advertising and giving away of cars, that they were going to be collared, I think he said, I don't recall the 15 exact quote but it was something along those lines, they 17 were going to be restrained in their ability to sell cars. 18 You know, they could advertise them at five grand off, he would say, but if they don't have any inventory, what good 20 is it going to do them? 21 When did you have that conversation with Q. 22 Pat Letart? 23 Somewhere in that time frame referred to Α. 24 previously.

The July to September, 2000, time frame?

Q.

25

00043 Somewhere around there, yeah. I didn't keep a contemporaneous log of my daily appointments, so I don't have exact dates. Did you have access to or did you Ο. 5 otherwise have any information concerning the allotments to 6 other vehicles, the actual allotments, how many vehicles 7 they got, what models? 8 Α. The question was -- would you repeat 9 that again? What was it? 10 Did you have access to or have any Q. 11 information concerning the actual allotment of vehicles, 12 whether ordinary or preferential, during this time frame, to 13 other dealerships? 14 Not other than just, you know, Α. 15 conversation from, you know, Pat Letart to me, telling me what their plans were. 17 Okay. And --Q. 18 I didn't have any access, not privy to 19 any of Ford's data or -- we only know what we can get, and 20 we only hear what others get. We did know, at that point in 21 time, we did know, in fact, what, you know, Lincoln 22 Mercury -- Pat Letart would tell us that Lincoln Mercury of 23 Kings Auto Mall was given this many vehicles and, you know, 24 we were given this many vehicles, and maybe Fairfield

25 Lincoln Mercury was given so many vehicles. So it was

00044 1 communicated to us that we had these cars in the aggregate. Q. Were you ever told what Eastside Lincoln 3 Mercury was given by Pat Letart? 4 What specific numbers? Α. 5 Q. Yes. 6 Α. Not that I recall. 7 Okay. The conversation that you just Q. related from Pat Letart, in the reference that I started 8 9 your questioning with, which indicated reduction of ELM's 10 vehicle allocation, is that where your understanding that 11 that was the intention came from, the conversation with Pat 12 Letart? 13 Were the cars coming from their Α. 14 particular allocation given to us, is that the question? 15 Q. Yes. 16 It was intimated that, yes, it was. Α. 17 During any of your conversations with Q. 18 Pat Letart, did you encourage him to send you vehicles 19 versus sending them to Eastside Lincoln Mercury? 20 Me, personally, did I encourage him? Α. 21 Q. Yes. 22 Α. No. I mean, me, personally, I didn't, 23 but, you know, our general manager, in conversation, I would 24 be present if they had a conversation, most of the time, 25 about cars, and that was the plan, you know, give the dealer

00045

group all the cars, you know, to get them sold. Q. Can you recall any conversations where it was suggested by Mr. Letart that the dealer group was given the cars exclusive of Eastside Lincoln Mercury? A. No, I couldn't say that to be a fact. The cars, once again, are dispersed in the aggregate. So I 7 don't know, you know, if these cars were ordered by -- you know, a lot of times the cars may come in, maybe they can 9 get cars from additional regions, maybe an additional region 10 outside of ours has an overabundance of supply of cars. The 11 factories track the daily supply of vehicles on a regional 12 and a city-by-city, I'm sure, basis. And then if other areas have cars that maybe have been turned down, as I specifically mentioned before, by, you know, the peddling 15 back and forth between the wholesaler and then back to us, then those cars would be subsequently available to maybe 17 another region. So many times we were offered cars, in and 18 outside of this time frame, that were maybe cars that were, you know, originally supposed to go to maybe Lexington or 20 Louisville or -- you know, in the car business, it's, you 21 know, turn and earn almost. And if you're selling the cars, then they're going to pump you the inventory, when it's 23 available to them. 2.4 Okay. Can you provide me any specific Q.

25 examples of the distribution of marketing money to the

00046

5

7

Kenwood Dealer Group, or even specifically Eastside Lincoln Mercury, which you believe to have not been available to 3 other dealerships?

Yeah, as I referred to in my affidavit, there were monies that were sent to us on specific car lines. For instance, you know, a dealer's inventory is such that if you have a bunch of leftover automobiles from, for instance, 2001 models, and now you move into the 2002 models that are out, and then here in January and February and 10 March you still have last year's inventory, you know, 11 because of the additional allocation that we got, we were 12 heavy in cars. You know, we sold a lot of them but we were 13 heavy in cars. And well into January and February of a subsequent year, we would have an abundance of these leftover cars. And the factory had already paid us out, if

15 16 you will, in cars. 17 The factory has programs to liquidate 18 the dealer's inventory, for obvious reasons. If they 19 liquidate the old inventory, then in comes the new and keeps 20 the production ongoing. So, you know, after we have been 21 paid out, the factory had pretty much absolved themselves of their responsibility of merchandising these leftover 23 vehicles that we had, and I'm talking specifically about 24 Lincolns, Town Cars. Our store, Northgate Lincoln Mercury,

25 and I'm sure the other -- I know that Kenwood, or, excuse

00047

5

6 7

15

17

18

me, Lincoln Mercury of Kings Auto Mall had Town Cars, for instance, and Pat Letart came to Jerry Mullins with a little program to help liquidate, additional monies to liquidate these vehicles.

Now, at that point in time do I know that other dealers had them, do they have those vehicles in stock? I didn't really know. Maybe they did or maybe they didn't. But it was told to me, in no uncertain terms, that here's some additional monies available, you know, to 10 liquidate your position in these cars, get rid of them. And, you know, this was like the last, the last funds

12 available to, you know, to liquidate these cars. 13 They would have specific programs to, 14 you know, put the cars in. You can't sell them, put them in

rental inventory. Here's some additional monies, put them in your rental inventory. Let your Lincoln customers drive them when they come in. So buy them down, just get them out of inventory.

19 You don't know whether or not those same Q. 20 or similar programs were offered to other dealers that had 21 old inventory as well?

22 Α. I was told that this was specific to us 23 by Pat Letart and my general manager, Jerry Mullins. They 24 would say, hey, we got monies here that these other dealers 25 aren't privy to, don't have, you know, we're going to be in

00048 a unique position, let's roll. Q. You don't know whether or not other dealers had the similar inventory situation, that is the group of old Town Cars, by example? I don't think they had a whole lot of Α. 6 inventory to begin with, so I don't think they had a lot of 7 leftover cars either. 8 Q. Do you have any specific recollection or 9 can you provide me with a specific example of what has been 10 termed a "sham contest"? 11 Who was the author of that quote, "sham Α. 12 contest"? Not me. 13 No, that's what counsel has predicted Q. 14 that you would testify about. Let me go back and review that in its 15 Α. 16 context. What exhibit is that on? 17 I think it's Exhibit 2 to your Q. 18 deposition, and it's an exhibit within the exhibit. And it 19 is Exhibit B within Exhibit 2 of the deposition. 20 If somebody can find it for me in here, Α. 21 I'll be glad to refer to it. 22 MR. FLEMER: Mr. Mullins, I'm handing 23 you the page Mr. Hengehold has referred to. And I think he 24 mentioned this, but I want the record to reflect, for your

25 knowledge, that this document was prepared by our office and

00049

it's a summary of what we anticipated were the areas that you would testify to.

THE WITNESS: Okay. 4 I can only address what my specific Α. 5 answers are, but this would seem to me to indicate about a contest or refer to a contest that we had with the Gentry 7 Shop, you know, on the previous allocation that we had gotten, the additional allocations. They had a little contest that was specific to our dealer group, I was told by 10 my general manager and Pat Letart, that it was a -- if we 11 had sold so many cars, which obviously we were going to be the only dealer, our dealer group would have been the only ones that could have won the contest because we had the cars. If you have a contest that, you know, you limited the other people's ability to win, then obviously we're going to 15 win, someone in our dealer group. So that was, I can only 17 assume that's what the reference is here to a sham contest, 18 was we were taken -- Northgate Lincoln Mercury won the little contest. It was about Lincolns and Grand Marquis, 20 and Mountaineers, if I recall. And we were taken to the 21 Gentry Shop on 747, and we were -- the store was closed for us, our group of our sales staff, and, in the evening, I 23 don't recall what day it was, but we were allowed to shop, 24 and I was given like \$700 in funds, I guess, not cash

25 directly, but I was given a store credit, if you will. So I

00050 bought a couple, two or three sport coats and some other stuff, shirts, ties. And then specific salespeople had, you know, the salespeople had maybe 300 bucks or so of store credit to go and shop and buy themselves, you know, some clothing. We had won the contest, supposedly, within our organization, and --7 Was the Northgate group allowed to do Q. 8 this shopping exclusive of Fairfield or Kings? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Q. And it was because you --11 As far as I know, yes. Α. 12 Q. And it was because your dealership 13 outperformed the other dealerships? 14 Yeas, as far as I recall, that's true. Α. 15 So at least with respect to it being a Q. 16 contest among the dealerships, it appears to have truly been 17 a contest and you won? 18 Α. It was a contest -- what was your 19 statement? Let's try --20 Q. At least as much as it was a contest 21 between the three Lincoln Mercury dealerships inside the 22 Kenwood Dealer Group, it was a contest and your dealership 23 won? 2.4 It was a contest that was sponsored by Α.

25 the Lincoln Mercury Division.

00051		
1	Q	Right.
2	A	And was it exclusive to our dealerships?
3	I think so.	
4	Q	Okay.
5	A	And we won, yes.
6	Q	All right. And Paragraph No. 2, that I
7	quoted before, go	es on to say, "contest and vehicle
8	programs." Do yo	u have a recollection of any vehicle
9	programs which yo	u would classify as a "sham"?
10	A	You know, as I stated before, my view
11	was they were loo	king for a way to disperse some monies to
12	liquidate our pos	ition in these vehicles. So, you know, if
13	they wanted to ma	ke up a contest specific to us, you know,
14	that's what they	would do, just as long as they achieve
15	their ultimate go	al of liquidating the inventory. A sham
16	contest, I mean,	you could, you know, as I've stated before,
17	the clothing cont	est would be one.
18	Q	Do you know if any vehicle programs or
19	contests were of	ered to Eastside Lincoln Mercury during
20	this same time for	ame?
21	A	Can't really speak to that, no.
22	Q	Okay. Who was the training sales staff
23	at Northgate?	
24	A	Who was the training sales staff?
25	Q	Right.

00052 Well, the question "who" refers to one, and then "staff" refers to multiple people, so I don't understand that question. What was the question? Well, who was or were the training sales Ο. 5 staff at Northgate, and let's stick with the 1999-2000 time 6 7 Well, it would be Gene Mullins and, you 8 know, other managers. We were the -- I mean, it's part of the job description to motivate and train the sales staff, 10 so that would be me and the other managers. 11 And did you advise your salesmen to tell Q. 12 customers that KDG, Kenwood Dealer Group, received 13 preferential treatment from the manufacturer? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Q. Yes? 16 Yes. Α. 17 What preferential treatment did you Q. 18 believe you were receiving from the manufacturer? 19 Distribution of inventory. The issue Α. 20 was that, if I can elaborate, the issue was that Eastside 21 Lincoln Mercury was on a campaign. They were advertising vehicles, and I, you know, even in the meeting, I thought 23 that it was brilliant. They were advertising \$5,000 off and 24 \$10,000 off. It seemed to me that they wanted to be a thorn 25 in the side to our organization, and how else could they

00053

compete but just undercut the pricing, you know, undercut the pricing. So what I was told to do was to address, in the sales meetings, upon conferring with the general managers, hey, how are we going to combat this \$5,000, what are we going to do to counteract that when a customer comes to us and says, hey, they have \$5,000 off of this specific 7 car or that specific car, and my job was to load their lips, if you will, to give them more tracts that were part of the sales process. When a customer comes and asks you a 10 question, hopefully you have an answer to their objection or 11 their question or their statement. So when they would come to us and say, well, Eastside Lincoln Mercury has five grand off, I would instruct the salespeople to say, well, then tell your customer they can have ten grand off but they don't have any cars to sell. Let's make it 15 grand, but they don't really have much of an inventory to choose from. 17 If you don't want the purple car with the green roof that 18 they've added to it, then -- so that was the training, was to load their lips with word tracts to combat the 20 advertising of competitors. And that was, once again, after 21 conferring with my immediate superior in what to do, how can we combat this. I didn't really, I didn't feel, personally, 23 as a general sales manager, that it was impactful to our 24 store. You know, Eastside or some of the other ones, I

25 mean, we dominated, in terms of sales, our organization, so

00054 it was like a minor thorn in the side. Q. Was one of the word tracts that you provided to your salespeople that the Kenwood Dealer Group would soon be the only Lincoln Mercury dealer in this area? A. Yeah, yeah. Did I say that? I'm sure I 6 did say that at some point in the meetings. 7 What was your basis for saying that? Q. 8 Α. Well, the reasoning for it was just 9 motivation, to once again re-enforce to the customer that, 10 hey, we're going to have all the cars, we're going to be 11 dominant, we're going to enjoy the geminy in our market, because we have all the cars. That was the plan. If there 13 was a grand plan, that was it, written or unwritten. 14 So what I -- my job is to motivate the 15 sales staff. So when I'd get with the sales staff I'd say, hey, they can advertise the cars for whatever they want. If 17 they don't have an inventory from which to choose, then it's 18 not going to be a factor. And I would also tell them, you 19 know, that the cars they're advertising for 15 grand off, or 20 excuse me, for ten grand off on a Lincoln was not ten grand off MSRP, it was ten grand off their price of the car, which made have included additional options to the vehicle. So 23 part of the training process was to keep the sales staff 24 fully informed of what exactly 10,000 off was, so you don't

25 lose a customer, you know, just on price.

00055 1 Q. Okay. Α. Even in communication with -- I had friends at the other organizations that I had worked with previously, and they would call to, you know, trade for cars with us, you know. Their dealership, Eastside, would call and say, hey, look, you guys show this specific car, do you 7 want to trade it? And I would, you know, because I knew people over there, I would still go ahead and trade with them. They weren't really a factor, so I would go ahead and 10 trade with them. And I was told in no uncertain terms by 11 Larry Feldhaus that, you know, they're the enemy, don't trade with them. What are you doing trading with them? Well, I wasn't told by anybody, up until this point, not to 14 trade with them. 15 What was the time frame of Larry 16 Feldhaus telling you not to trade with Eastside? 17 A. I don't know. There again, I could, you 18 know, with some thought, I could probably be more specific. But do I have an exact date? No. Somewhere around that time zone that we specifically referred to. 21 The July --Q. 22 Α. Somewhere around there. 23 -- to September of 2000? Ο. 24 The best that I can recall. Α. 25 O. Okay. Prior to your last answer, your

00056

5

6

second to last answer, my question was: Upon what information, if any, did you base your statement to your salespeople that the Kenwood Dealer Group would soon be the only Lincoln Mercury dealer in the area?

- What did I base that information on?
- Ο. What information did you base that

statement on?

7 8 Α. General statements from, you know, my 9 immediate superior and his, Mr. Reichert not included, but, 10 you know, through our conversations, not specific meetings. 11 There were no -- we never had any formal meetings addressing, you know, or talking about these issues, but in conversations, maybe Mr. Feldhaus, for instance, or even one of his subordinates, would call up looking for a car and you would get to talking about general business. You know, during the course of the conversation it would be, you know, 17 we're looking for this car or that car and we would talk 18 about the other dealers in the area and how weak their sales were. And it was one of our goals, not a written goal, but it was one of our goals, originally, to put Jim Dixon out of 21 business, or at least dominate the market in such a fashion that, you know, he would have to sell and move on. And then, you know, we did that. I mean, you know, Dixon was a

24 viable force in the market up until 1996 or so. Our

25 particular store, at that time, what was told to me was we

00057 wanted to be a strong third in the city, and I found it laughable. I thought, well, how about No. 1. But anyhow, we were on a mission to -- and there again, it was from, you know, our general manager, and I don't know where he got his information, I can't speak to that, but one of the goals was let's put the SOBs out of business, so --7 You referred earlier, when you were Q. 8 talking about the dealer trade, that you had friends at 9 Eastside Lincoln Mercury that you would occasionally trade 10 vehicles with. Who were those individuals? 11 Dale Snider was -- actually, I had hired Α. 12 him as a salesperson back in, you know, '96 or '97, and then he left our company and went to work for Eastside Lincoln Mercury, but him and I have worked together at another Lincoln Mercury ten years prior, for a number of years. So I just knew him from, you know, in the business, and I knew 17 him personally. 18 (THEREUPON, AN OFF-THE-RECORD DISCUSSION 19 WAS HELD). 20 Now, stepping back for a minute, when Ο. 21 Mr. Flemer was questioning you at the outset of your deposition, you indicated that you started at Northgate Lincoln Mercury in 1996. 23 2.4 Α.

And now you just referenced a prior

Q.

25

00058

5

6

7

Lincoln Mercury dealership. Can you, very quickly, in a chronological order, go through your employment history, from either -- how far did you go in your education, how far did you go in school?

- High school and some college.
- Ο. What's your date of birth?
- 8/25/52. Α.
- 8 Q. And starting in 1980, tell me what you 9 were doing in 1980 and who you were doing it for, and then
- 10 come forward chronologically. 11 Okay. Well, on 5/12 of 1973, I was Α. 12 employed by Ridgeview Lincoln Mercury. As a milestone, that 13 was also the day that my daughter was born, so I can refer to that one specifically. I was employed there until 1994, and it seems maybe June-something of '94, I left Ridgeview Lincoln Mercury. And then August the 25th, I think, of '94, 17 was my first day at one of the Kenwood Dealer Group's other 18 stores, which was Kings Toyota. I remember that because I got a ticket on my way home from my first day. So, after a 20 few months at Kenwood -- or at Kings Toyota, I resigned from 21 there and went to work for one day at Glenway Chevrolet. 22 Didn't like the product, and the dealership more, I guess, 23 because I had come from a state-of-the-art facility to -- I

- 24 didn't like the product, didn't like the dealership, so I
- 25 called and got a position with Mr. Reichert's firm at the

00059

24 April of '96.

Q.

25

Dodge store, which was Kings Dodge, and I worked in the business office there, which was the F&I office, the finance office. And then Jerry Mullins was hired as the general manager at Northgate Lincoln Mercury in '96, I think, in January. I'm not too sure, exactly. And then, at that point in time, from January on, he recruited me for about 7 three months to be his sales manager, although that was strictly against company policy. I mean, he called me numerous, numerous times a day, "you're my man, as soon as I 10 get these other guys out of here, you're the man, you're the 11 man. So, plus my anger, if you will, about being dismissed, summarily dismissed because of some other issue, that I've talked about before. In other words, some of the people in the firm, it's common practice to recruit. You know, I was recruited. And then I'm dismissed after, you know, six, seven, eight years of outstanding performance with the firm 17 because of some bullshit reason like, you know, meddling or 18 whatever, so that was my, why I was angry. So there is my 19 chronological answer for you. Sorry about that. 20 I missed the date of when you went from Q. 21 Kings Dodge F&I to, I assume, Northgate Lincoln Mercury 22 General Sales Manager. That would be in April of '96, I think, Α.

Okay. So it was at the Ridgeview

00060 Lincoln Mercury that you worked with Dale Snider? A. Yes, and also at Northgate, as I referred to before, I had hired him as a salesperson there in '96 or '97. I don't recall the exact date, but --5 Ο. Paragraph 10 of your affidavit -- you can take a minute to go ahead and look at that. I have a 7 few questions about that. 8 Α. (Witness complies). Okay. 9 Q. What time frame were you referring to 10 with respect to the call from Don Bach? 11 Well, I'd need to reflect on that. Our Α. 12 company, at that point in time -- or Mr. Reichert's company 13 I should say, bought that store like in '99, I'm not really exactly sure, so it would have been prior to that, maybe about 2000, I don't recall. But Don Bach and I were peers I guess, you know, he was the manager there, and we would talk 17 many, many times about, you know, dealer trade programs. I 18 was his comforting ear when he wanted to moan and groan about the business in general. I really can't give you an 20 exact date, I don't have it, but I remember specifically him 21 calling me to compare the size of, you know, how much did you get from, you know, Lincoln Mercury with respect to this 23 Lincoln contest or Mountaineer contest, you know, whatever 24 the reference was. So I can't really give you an exact

25 date.

00061

7

8

9

11

15

17

- Is it your recollection that whatever that time frame was, obviously prior to the acquisition of that dealership by the Kenwood Dealer Group, that Jim Dixon 4 Lincoln Mercury was receiving a payment from Ford Motor Company or from Lincoln Mercury that you were also receiving, perhaps in different amounts, but you were both involved in the same program, so that you could compare your results?
- They had programs that were commonplace Α. 10 throughout the nation, not just in our region. But they would have programs, national programs, that you would have 12 to go on-line and claim the monies. And some of them were 13 district-oriented contests that would be oriented from the 14 district office. So, over the course of, you know, five or six years, seven years, 20 years in the business, it was routine that the factory would give money on specific cars as an incentive to move specific inventory.
- 18 Those programs were offered both to Q. 19 Kenwood Dealer Group dealerships and others as well?
- 20 Yes, they had programs that were Α. 21 available to everybody, of course.
- 22 Q. Was it prohibited to share the amount of 23 your payment with another dealer?
- 2.4 Was I specifically prohibited from Α. 25 giving the information out?

00062 Either by your employer or by the manufacturer, did you understand there to be a prohibition? 3 Α. No. 4 Ο. Okay.

5

6

7

9

12

13

14

15

Α. What Mr. Bach was doing at that point in time, if I recall, was just digging for information. He was looking for specific data that he could then say that we had preferential treatment. We all knew and assumed that we had the preferential treatment. He was looking for a reason to 10 go to his immediate superior, in my opinion, he was looking for a reason to go to him as his basis for performance, or the lack thereof.

- Did the amount of the checks demonstrate Q. that, the preferential treatment that Mr. Bach was trying to ferret out?
- 16 He called to compare the size of the Α. 17 checks. I don't really recall, after that, what the size of 18 the checks were. I mean, I just remember the conversation 19 in its general form.
- 20 Who was the office manager at Northgate Q. 21 during your tenure?
- 22 Α. We had a couple of them. We had Tina 23 Hite. Actually, we had three. We had Tina Hite, and then 24 Tina left. I don't have the dates, but others here could 25 supply you with those. But she left and then one of her

00063

8

9

10

11

13

17

office people was named interim office manager. It was Sherry Kennedy. And she wasn't in the capacity for long, maybe three, four, five months, I don't recall. But she, in my opinion, wasn't qualified to do the job. And then we hired, Gary Mullins hired, I think Pat Edelstein was her name, and she actually had worked for Dixon Dealer Group, I 7 think.

Q. When you refer in Paragraph 9 of your affidavit to "the office manager," are you referring to all three of these individuals or one in specifically? At least a couple of them. Sherry would Α. 12 be one, and Pat Edelstein would be the other one. I'm

trying to recall if Tina would come to me. You know, I would try to refer them to the general manager that, hey, you know, where should these funds go? Under the accounting, you know, we would get monies specific to certain cars, and we would base our advertising and pricing 18 of cars based on the amount of monies that we were 19 receiving. So we would, for instance, if we were given a

20 sales quota of 50 cars, for instance, and we were on what 21 would call stair-step program, once we had achieved the 50

car mark, then the monies payable to the dealer group, or at

23 least to our store, retroactive back, was fully accounted

24 for. In other words, when I would make a sale, when we

25 would make a sale, we would accrue monies that were yet

00064

7

8

unearned. We would make an accounting entry, a receivable from Lincoln Mercury of X number of dollars on a specific car, as unearned income. In other words, we would accrue it as income, and if we didn't hit the buggy, there was a charge to be taken at the end of the month.

Q. Is that what you're referring to in Paragraph 9, the allocation of the receipt of the cash on these accrued charges?

9 Α. Some of that, yes, some of that. And 10 then there may be other checks that would come in. I mean, 11 they would only come to me to ask about a check that they didn't know what they were supposed to do with it, you know, what's this \$500 for, what's this \$1,000 for. So I would go to the back and think for a minute, well, what was it for. Oh, put it toward this particular account, the Town Car cost of sales account, or put it toward this specific car. So 17 they would come to me with monies and I tried to refer them 18 to the GM and say, hey, find it out from him. And then he would just send them right back, so then I've got to handle to. So I would say, okay, let's put it to this specific car, this amount of money goes to this specific car, these monies that you're asking about goes to the Town Car line in 23 the aggregate. 2.4

So there's many, many checks that came through the organization, some of which were routine, and

00065

6

7

8

14

15

- some of which were, in my estimation, obviously available to every other dealer on the planet earth that sold Lincoln
 Mercuries, and some of which were, you know, to us, specifically, to move these extra cars. That's my recollection.
 - Q. Do you have any specific recollection of a payment that you know was unique to Northgate Lincoln Mercury that neither the amount nor the type of payment were paid too any other dealership?
- 10 A. Don't ask specific dates, but my 11 recollection is that we had monies available to us on 12 Mountaineer and on Town Car that was intimated to me, as I 13 stated before, that were unique to our dealer group.
 - Q. Who intimated that to you?
 - A. Mr. Patrick Letart.
- Q. With respect to the Mountaineers, do you have any time frame that you recollect that you were receiving at Northgate Lincoln Mercury these intimated
- 19 unique payments?
 20 A. That's going to be difficult, once
 21 again, to address that without reference to data that would
 22 be better gotten from other people in the room here,
- 23 Mr. Reichert or, you know, Lincoln Mercury. In other words, 24 what I'm saying is, if I could go back and compare, at least 25 what spreadsheets I have, the amount of sales -- excuse me,

00066

the amount of sales that we did compared to what the allocation of the flow of inventory was from the district to the group, I could maybe identify a better time frame. But to go off a general recollection, you know, some of those statements I made obviously are in general. All of them, I feel, I know to be 100 percent accurate. But, you know, if 7 you're looking for specific dates, it's going to be difficult for me to give you very, very specific dates, other than during my tenure at this company. 10 The spreadsheets that you're referring Q. 11 to, is that a record that you created personally and still 12 maintain? 13 I don't maintain it, I mean, it's --Α. 14 Do you still have it? Q. 15 I have it on a floppy disc somewhere. Α. My hard drive is, you know, destroyed. I had to reformat 17 it, so a lot of them were lost. But I made a program just 18 to track, you know, to make my job easier. I mean, I actually hired somebody to build me a little spreadsheet to make my job easier. At the end of my month, I put in my last deal and I'm done. I could move on to the next month. 22 And I've shared that spreadsheet with a few other people in the firm, so they could use the same thing. So I had data 24 that was, you know, in Microsoft Excel format, that had

25 January through December sales, you know, of specific years,

00067 some of which was destroyed by my computer being reformatted and some of which I have -- well, I've since bought another 3 computer, and I still have the old one that I had, so --Who did you share your Microsoft Excel Q. 5 program with at the firm? 6 Α. At that point in time, it was Ralph Ely, 7 which at that point in time was the sales manager for 8 Lincoln Mercury of Kings Auto Mall; and then there was Dave Hyatt, which was, for a short time, sales manager at one of 10 the other stores, I think it was Saturn, maybe. And any of 11 the people that had worked with me had seen the spreadsheets that I would keep. All it was was compilation of data that was specific to us, you know, what we sold, what we grossed, what they were paid in commissions. And then from that I generated an end-of-the-month report that I could give to my superior, you know, on what we did, what we grossed, and so 17 forth. So it wasn't a -- you know, I mean, it's a program 18 in generic form that other people could use and put in their 19 own numbers. 20 There's no comparison information on Q. 21 there, comparing Northgate Lincoln Mercury with other dealerships in the city or to other dealerships in the Kenwood Dealer Group? 23 2.4 Α.

Okay. Do you still maintain any written

Ο.

25

00068

7

8

11

13

14

15 16

17

records of sales, sales programs, revenue or expenses from your time at Northgate Lincoln Mercury?

Α. When I left the company, I packed up a bunch of stuff that was, that I felt was what I needed for, you know, not knowing what my position was going to be. I thought, well, since I'm experienced in Volkswagen and Lincoln Mercury both, you know, I packed up all the, you know, stuff that I had stored and filed myself. This was something that I could refer to for future use, not 10 specifically addressing this, but if I were to gain employment at some other firm, then I could take the 12 procedures and programs and so forth with me, so I could jump start or hit the ground running, if you will, to another agency.

Can you provide me, a little more specifically, what the stuff is, the titles, or are they manuals and brochures and stuff? Specifically, can you give me any examples of that which you took with you?

18 19 Well, just as I said, just maybe sales Α. 20 training manuals, not specifically from our firm, but stuff that I had acquired over a number of years, stuff that I had filed away, maybe programs, you know, that I had. We have a 23 file cabinet, as you do in your business, and we've got 24 stuff that we refer to, and it may be programs that were 25 from Volkswagen, from Lincoln Mercury. "Programs" meaning,

00069 you know, anything. It could be an APR program or whatever, whatever. So, you know, --3 When you say "programs," are you Q. 4 referring to computer programs or --5 A. Written documentation from the factories about incentives to dealers; finance programs available, you 6 7 know, from the captive finances companies, Volkswagen 8 Credit, Ford Motor Credit, that I could take and use at -- I 9 mean, it's information that I could get, you know, from the 10 other dealer, but yet, if I were to -- after I'd left, if I 11 was going to go to work at another firm, I would take these 12 programs, we just referred to a factory program, a factory outline of their factory-to-dealer incentives that were not specific to us, but, you know, for general use of that about 15 the country. 16 Did you take with you in this bunch of Ο. 17 stuff anything that was specific to either the Kenwood 18 Dealer Group or Northside (sic)? 19 Northgate? Α. 20 Northgate, I'm sorry. Q. 21 No, not that I recall. Α. 22 Did you have anything electronic, any 23 discs, floppy discs, CDs? 2.4 I did have a CD ROM I burned that had Α. 25 documents that I used to communicate either to the sales

00070 force or to customers or, you know, within the organization. And I took it out and, you know, I just downloaded stuff that I felt that I needed from stuff that I had originated or it was sent to me. Any documents from the company, specifically, I didn't really have a whole lot of interest 6 in them. So I took whatever was under Windows in "My 7 Documents." 8 Q. Do you still have that CD? 9 Α. No, I don't have it any longer. It 10 cracked. It was a CD ROM and I put it in the bottom of just a box of the awards that I got, you know, other stuff that you acquire, a desk top, whatever, and just in transporting it it got cracked. It was no big deal. I mean, I wanted it, but it's gone. 14 15 How about e-mail addresses, web sites, Q. 16 and company, by that I mean Ford or Lincoln Mercury, 17 electronic communication, addresses, did you download any of 18 that information and take it with you? 19 It may have been in My Documents on that Α.

- 20 particular CD ROM.
- 21 But before this CD was destroyed, did Q. 22 you have an opportunity to load it in your computer at home 23 and read it?
- 2.4 Α. I just kept it on the CD.

25

Q. Did you ever transfer any of the

00071 1 electronic information to your home off of the CD? I may have, I don't really recall, but I 3 may have. 4 Did you ever transfer, perhaps over the Q. 5 Internet or through electronic ways, rather than on a floppy or a disk, information from your computer at the dealership 7 to your computer at home which would maintain e-mail 8 addresses of either co-workers, manufacturers, things like 9 10 A. In some of the papers that I referred to 11 I had some e-mail addresses of some people who work for 12 Lincoln Mercury. Some of them you could -- some of them were, you know, unique to the people, and a lot of them you would memorize. 14 Going back to the bunch of stuff that 15 16 you packed up, you told me about training manuals, financing 17 information, some information that was downloaded onto the 18 CD, perhaps some that was electronically transferred to your 19 home, anything else? 20 Did I take --Α. That you took with you upon your 21 Q. termination. 22 Α. Not anything that was, you know, 23 meaningful to me. 24 Q. Without being argumentative, it may be 25 meaningful to me. Can you think of anything else that you

```
00072
   1
      took with you?
                     Α.
                          No.
   3
                          MR. HENGEHOLD: Let me take a short
   4
      break and talk to my clients, and then we can come back in.
   5
                          (THEREUPON, A SHORT RECESS WAS TAKEN).
   6
                          MR. HENGEHOLD: Those are all the
   7
      questions I have at this time, thank you.
   8
                    CROSS-EXAMINATION
   9
      BY MS. MCNELLIE:
  10
                          Mr. Mullins, my name is Beth McNellie
                     Q.
  11
      and I represent the Ford Motor Company and Jerry Carter and
  12
      Al Laub, who have all been sued in this litigation.
  13
                          When did you first find out about this
  14
      case?
                          This? I don't know when the case was
  15
  16
      first filed, I have no knowledge of that, but, you know, it
  17
      was my understanding that the case had been ongoing for a
  18
      couple of years, so --
  19
                          Who told you about that?
                     Q.
  20
                          I don't recall, specifically, maybe Pat
                     Α.
  21
      Letart may have mentioned it. I don't -- like I said, I
      didn't really reflect on that, didn't think about it, but
  23 now that I do, he may have indicated to me that there was
  24 litigation, and I know that through my conversations with
  25 some of the other members of his staff, as I alluded to
```

00073 before, or referred directly to before, that they had mentioned litigation. And also Larry Feldhaus, now that you ask, had mentioned to me that, you know, the company is involved in litigation with his company, so don't do this 5 and don't do that. 6 Ο. Did someone give you a copy of the 7 complaint? 8 Α. Of course not, no. 9 You talked about, you said "his staff," Q. 10 you were referring to Mr. Woeste's staff? 11 Mr. Woeste's staff, a couple of people Α. 12 on the staff that I referred to earlier. 13 And you talked about Mr. Snider that had Q. worked with you previously. Is there anyone else on 14 15 Mr. Woeste's staff that you're friends with? 16 Well, I know Art Schultz, who has been a Α. 17 long-time loyal employee of Mr. Woeste's. 18 What position does Mr. Schultz have? Q. 19 As far as I know, he's a salesperson. Α. 20 He may have another capacity that I'm not familiar with. Anyone else on Mr. Woeste's staff that 21 Q. 22 you're friends with? 23 Α. No, not that I can recall. I mean, I 24 didn't know Mr. Woeste here (indicating). I never met him

25 personally until, you know, I had called him, so --

00074	
1	Q. When is the last time that you spoke
2	with Mr. Snider?
3	A. The last communication I had with him, I
4	left him an e-mail message, trying to recruit him, but he
5	didn't respond to that.
6	Q. Was that before you were terminated?
7	A. No, that was after I was terminated.
8	Q. You were trying to recruit him for what
9	purpose?
10	A. To work with me in the mortgage
11	business.
12	Q. Have you had a conversation with
13	Mr. Snider about this case?
14	A. No.
15	Q. Has Mr. Snider tried to recruit you to
16	go to work for Eastside?
17	A. No.
18	Q. When is the last time that you spoke to
19	Pat Letart?
20	A. On or about the month of my termination
21	from the Kenwood Dealer Group. I don't really recall the
22	specific instance where I talked to him. But, you know,
23	that last month that I was there, I would have had obvious
24	contact with him, just the general nature of the business.
25	Q. Did you speak with Pat about the

00075 1 termination? Α. Let me reflect on that a minute. Not 3 that I recall. At this point, I don't recall. Were you social friends with Mr. Letart? Ο. 5 No, I had been to social events with him 6 that were, that were company produced. That would be, you 7 know, for instance, we would have a boat ride in celebration 8 of our sales, and Mr. Letart and his wife were invited. And they were frequently invited to other company functions that 10 we would have, in which me and Jerry Mullins and him were 11 socially connected. Me, specifically, you know, I dealt a lot with Pat Letart, didn't have an enormous amount of respect for him, but, you know, he would not be somebody that I would call and ask out to dinner, if that's the 15 definition of social. 16 Can you explain to me how the allocation Q. 17 system works for Lincoln Mercury? 18 Well, my knowledge of it is that it Α. 19 originates, obviously, from Ford headquarters somewhere. 20 They track a daily supply of inventory that, you know, a 21 specific dealer or all dealers have. And my belief, my understanding is, they take the compilation of data, compare it to empirical data, which would be the vehicles past sales 24 in the year-over-year comparison or maybe the year and prior

25 year, two years prior, comparison, and then they would

00076

11

12

17

24

25

allocate or distribute cars based on the production, the sales production of the particular selling season, for instance. If we had available to us a large assortment of cars, then they would be, if the factory would bring us an offering, it was almost like a -- they would have specific units in specific vehicle lines made available to us. We're 7 going to offer you, for instance, this month, ten Town Cars, five Grand Marquis, whatever, whatever, depending on the production schedules, etcetera, with the company, and then 10 we were allocated cars based on that.

Sometimes they would, the factory would like to pressure you to take slow selling cars in order to get this allocation or that allocation of maybe a hot selling car, specifically Navigator. You know, the Navigator was allocated to our stores based on how much garbage we took. Garbage would mean, you know, some other vehicle line, whether it be a, you know, some car where we 18 didn't have a big market presence, in the macro sense. If Lincoln Mercury didn't do well in Cougar, for instance, and 20 they had an abundance of them available, then we were 21 pressured by Mr. Letart and company to, if you want your Navigators, you need to buy some of this crap. So it was 23 politics in some sense, and it was based on empirical data in others.

And at that point in time, it was my

00077

10

11

13

15

16

understanding and, I think, in the overall sense, the objective of the company was to, whether published or 3 unpublished, was to consolidate dealerships in specific markets -- did you get that spelling right? -- to have them 5 under one umbrella owner for expedient reasons. So the factory could, you know, it was my belief that they could 7 better control the distribution of cars and pricing, etcetera, and didn't want their particular vehicles debased 9 by Mr. Woeste's advertising.

- Did someone from Ford tell you that? Q.
- I think it was obvious to anybody with Α. 12 half a brain within the organization. Ford's mission or their goal, it seemed to me, was pretty much widely published throughout the Automotive News, which is a, you know, vertical market magazine that most of the dealers subscribe to.
- 17 Do you know how far back you were Q. 18 reading about that in the Automotive News?
- 19 I know that after, you know, after their Α. 20 dismissal of Jack Nassera, the plans were then changed. But, you know, I really can't address that. I mean, it goes 21
- back a few years, maybe three or four years ago.
- Ο. Did you ever read anything specific to
- 24 the Cincinnati market in the Automotive News?
- 25 A. No, I read specifics in the Denver

00078 market. At that point in time, the Denver market, I think, was consolidated under Autoway or whatever. And other markets where -- I don't know. The Denver market is the only one I can specifically recall. 5 Ο. And those were Ford dealerships in 6 Denver, not Lincoln Mercury dealerships; right? 7 Yeah, the Elway stores, at the time, Α. 8 were four stores, and they may have had a Lincoln Mercury. 9 You know, my view was that Ford and Lincoln Mercury are one 10 in the same. 11 We were talking about allocation before, Q. 12 and you talked about the factory bringing an offering. Is 13 that sometimes referred to as a wholesale meeting? 14 That's exactly what they refer to it as. 15 Q. Did you attend wholesale meetings when 16 you were at Northgate? 17 Oh, absolutely. Α. 18 How often did those happen? Q. 19 A. At least monthly, we would have 20 wholesale meetings. Did I attend every one of them? No, I 21 probably attended 75 percent of them. I worked for what I would refer to as an absentee general manager that just, 23 here comes Pat Letart, I don't have time for him, go do it, 24 whatever, which I didn't mind doing it, you know. 25 Q. So, the wholesale meetings, 75 percent

00079 of the time, would just be you and Mr. Letart? Α. I was involved -- it's probably better 3 said that I was involved with the wholesale meetings 75 percent of the time in the aggregate. In that 75 percent, it may have been cohabited by Jerry Mullins, which is our general manager. So when he felt it necessary 7 to get involved in it, he would, for whatever reason. 8 Q. Was Jerry Mullins there more than half 9 of the time for those wholesale meetings? 10 A. He didn't punch a time clock. He was on 11 salary and he was free to come and go whenever he wanted. 12 Was he there more than half of the time in general, or for 13 particular meetings? 14 No, no, for the wholesale meetings. Q. 15 Α. No, I would say less than half the time. 16 It would be more like 25 percent of the time. 17 Have you ever heard of the allocation Q. 18 system referred to as "turn and earn." 19 Yeah, by someone from -- be more Α. 20 specific, someone from --Just in general. 21 Q. 22 In general? Sure, of course. Α. 23 And the number crunching that you Ο. 24 described earlier that you thought was done at Ford 25 headquarters, that reflects the turn and earn part of the

08000 1 allocation; right? Α. Repeat that again. 3 Ο. You talked, you testified earlier that 4 you believed that somewhere at Ford headquarters there was an analysis done of the day supply compared against past sales of a particular product line, and that's how the 7 allocation was determined, based on what was produced by the 8 factory. 9 Α. Right. 10 Is that the part that's called "turn and Q. 11 earn?" 12 That part is referred to as "turn and earn," yes. 13 14 And when the wholesale meeting occurred, Q. 15 Pat Letart would come out and tell you what you had turned 16 and earned for that three-month period that was coming up? 17 When he would come out, he would offer Α. 18 his numbers to us, based somewhat, I can't weight it specifically, but based somewhat on turn and earn. Also 19 part of the process was his idea of what we could do, based on, you know, if we had this many cars or that many cars. So his offering was not strictly on turn and earn, that was 23 a part of the formula, if you will. 2.4 Was there a sheet he would bring to you, Q. 25 to the wholesale meeting, that would have your allocated

00081 numbers on it? Α. Yes. It would have -- he would compile a little spreadsheet on most of those. It wasn't electronic, but it was printed. And for instance, I refer to a specific time frame that I like to refer to as like a summer selling season, and he would say, well, like, you 7 know, in July of last year, you sold this many of that and that many of this and this many of that. This market today, in the aggregate, is a little more, so we think you could do 10 this many, that many or this many. So he would come to us with his offerings, and then it was our prerogative to either take those cars or to pass on the allotment of cars or to change it, and then thus the bartering would begin, here's what we can do. We already had our numbers that we had forecast, and we would put our numbers up and compare them to his, and then we would just beat each other back and 17 forth up. He had some cars that he needed to pedal that 18 were, you know, aged inventory, maybe inventory of other 19 agents, you know. 20 Is that extra stuff that he had to sell Q. 21 the 30 or 40 cars that you referred to earlier when you were 22 talking to Mr. Hengehold? 23 Α. He had -- let me make sure your question 24 is clear. 25

You testified previously that you got 30

Q.

00082 or 40 Town Cars and Grand Marquis, I believe it was. Α. Right. 3 Ο. My question to you is: Did those 30 or 4 40 cars come from that aged inventory or places where dealerships had rejected parts of their allocation? 6 Α. Maybe a few of them would have, could 7 have. Some of them, in my belief, was that they came from 8 maybe a dealer that had closed a point, maybe a dealer that had rejected inventory because their inventory was swollen, 10 maybe it was an overproduction of cars, maybe another market 11 didn't meet their's. So, I mean, I really can't answer where the cars came from. It was my belief that they were in the pool of cars that needed to be dispersed, distributed, whatever you want to refer to them as, and we 15 had our pick from. 16 Did you ever have any reason to believe Q. 17 that those 30 to 40 extra cars that you got came from some 18 other dealership's earned allocation? 19 Well, yes, I did. I was -- you know, as Α. 20 I've said before, through conversations with Jerry Mullins 21 and through Pat Letart, who was obviously careful not to say that this is Eastside's inventory or these other people's 23 inventory in front of Jerry Mullins, and I don't know what 24 conversation they had, but what he would tell me was that, 25 hey, these are cars that are normally going to Eastside or

00083

7

8

9

10

11

13

15

16

18

19

to, you know, maybe to Florence, which was a, you know, another dealer in our area. So it was intimated as well as stated to me by Jerry Mullins that, hey, these are cars that these other guys aren't going to get, they're unique to us, you know, we've earned them, we're the kings of the world, so this is what we get.

- So did Jerry Mullins or anyone else tell Q. you that those were cars that had been specifically allocated to Eastside or Florence that they weren't even going to get offered?
- Jerry Mullins had indicated to me that Α. 12 cars were taken from Eastside and some of the other ones inventory and were given to us as their punishment, if you will, for their whoring out of their advertising, as he was quoted as saying.
 - Did anyone besides Jerry Mullins tell Q.

17 you that?

- Α. No.
- Did Jerry Mullins tell you who he heard Q.

20 that from?

21 Well, he would, yeah, I mean, he would Α. 22 say that, you know, if he would make a statement like that, 23 then he would qualify that it came from somebody at Lincoln 24 Mercury, whether it be, you know, can I point to Pat Letart 25 or to -- what's the gentleman's name? -- maybe the manager.

00084 I'm sorry, his name just slipped my mind. Q. You were never present for any of those 3 conversations between Mr. Mullins and anyone from Lincoln Mercury where that statement was made? 5 Could you answer my question first, who Α. the other guy was? 6 7 I don't know which other guy you're Q. 8 referring to, Mr. Carter, Mr. Wilson --9 Α. Jerry Carter, thank you. 10 So I couldn't point to those particular 11 people and say he got them from them or I got it from them. 12 I just don't, you know, --13 So you weren't present for any Q. 14 conversation between Mr. Jerry Mullins and anyone from 15 Lincoln Mercury saying that cars had been taken from 16 Eastside or Florence and given to your dealership? 17 A. I may have been, but not that I can 18 recall specifically. It wasn't an eventful part of my life, 19 as can be understood. I mean, it wasn't like it was a milestone, so it's not anything that I can recall. 21 Q. So, sitting here today, you don't know 22 where those 30 or 40 extra cars that you perceived that the 23 Kenwood Dealer Group got came from? 24 A. I think I know where they came from. 25 it provable? That's up to you guys. I know where they came

00085 from. They came from his inventory (indicating) and they came from other dealer's inventory. That's what was told to 3 4 And other than your conversation with Q. 5 Mr. Mullins where he said that's where they came from, you have no other basis to believe that? A. No, what I base my data on is statements 8 that I take data in and process it and then form a belief, like everybody else does. So, my belief is that's where the 10 cars came from, that was what was intimated or told to me 11 directly by various sources, and that's what I stand on. 12 I'm just trying to find out what your 13 various sources of data are. Other than your conversations with Mr. Mullins, are there any other sources of data you had to believe that those cars came from Eastside's 16 inventory? 17 I don't have anything that I can give Α. 18 you concrete and say here it is written in writing, of 19 course not. You know it and I know that, so let's move on. MR. FLEMER: Can I clarify for the 21 record that as you answered her earlier question, when you 22 pointed to the end of the table and said "his inventory," were you referring to Mr. Woeste? THE WITNESS: Yes. 2.4 25 MS. MCNELLIE: Thank you.

00086 Q. Earlier, you testified about the contest that allowed you to go to the Gentry Shop and get some 3 suits? 4 Α. Yes. 5 In regard to that contest, did any money Q. go directly to the Northgate dealership or to Mr. Reichert 7 or to the Kenwood Dealer Group, to your knowledge, or was it 8 just suits to the sales staff? 9 Α. Each, you know, I really don't -- I 10 can't answer to the fact that did we have a line of credit 11 set up, you know, with this organization (indicating), the 12 Gentry Shops, or where we presented a bill and that was taken care by someone. I can't really address that. All I 14 know is I was given an amount that I had to spend. Was it in writing, no, you know, and was there any checks issued, no. I didn't see any if there were, and I think that's 17 your --18 Well, actually, it's a little different 19 question. I understand that you got suits and either Ford 20 paid Gentry or however that worked. 21 Α. Right. 22 But aside from the suit issue, was there 23 any money that was paid to the dealership, as opposed to the suits going to the salespeople, with regard to that contest?

A. There could have been and I may not be

25

00087 privy to it. I can't recall. Q. You have no knowledge of that? 3 Α. I can't recall it. 4 Q. Paragraph 7 of your affidavit, --5 Uh-huh. 6 Q. -- the first full sentence on Page 3, it 7 states, "it was also the goal of Ford and Mr. Reichert to put Eastside Lincoln Mercury out of business so that it could also be sold to Mr. Reichert." Did someone tell you 10 that? 11 Α. Did who tell me that? 12 Did someone tell you that, anyone tell Q. 13 you that? 14 Just my immediate superior, that was a Α. 15 conversation that we had, which was that given the 16 consolidation within the industry at that point in time, 17 that was pretty much well documented through the media, that 18 in the Cincinnati market, you know, the dealer of choice was 19 Bob Reichert, based on sales volume, based on customer 20 satisfaction. Whatever data that goes into that decision, I 21 don't really have knowledge of. But it was told to me that, you know, we will be the dominant force. We already are and we will continue to be the dominant force in our market, and 24 the dealerships will be consolidated under one, you know, 25 under one ownership. I think that was the goal.

00088 Q. And you were told that by Mr. Jerry 2 Mullins? 3 A. Absolutely. 4 Anyone from Ford ever tell you that? Q. 5 Α. I don't recall. They could have, but I 6 don't recall. 7 Q. In Paragraph 11 of your affidavit, you 8 talk about money that was made available as year-end 9 incentives. 10 I'm sorry, what was the --Α. 11 Paragraph 11. Q. 12 What was the question? Α. 13 Right now, I'm just trying to focus you Q. 14 on Paragraph 11. 15 Okay. 16 Does that refer to the time frame as Q. 17 when the additional allocation was made available, are we 18 still talking about that same sell-down period in 2000? 19 In the first part of the sentence, I'm Α. 20 referring to Ford's practice, Lincoln Mercury's practice of supporting the dealers in liquidation of the product at year's end. The close-out allowances refers to a number of 23 things, which could be support in dollars, financing 24 programs, in addition to what is available on specific car 25 lines, just to help liquidate the owner. I go on to say

00089 that, outside of those programs, I was told by our general manager and others that we had some special programs that were exclusive to us, monies on specific cars or product lines to move them out. So it was Mr. Mullins who told you that Ο. 6 these programs were specific to Northgate or to the Kenwood 7 Dealer Group? 8 Α. Yeah. Most of the stuff, the 9 information that I'd get, was, a lot of it was from 10 Mr. Mullins, and some of it may have been from Pat Letart, some of it may have been in the meetings that we've had, cooperative meetings with all parties. 13 Can you tell me any specific comment Q. 14 that Mr. Letart made to you that indicated that there was a 15 special program that was not available to other dealers for 16 close-out purposes? 17 Can I address a specific program --Α. 18 Q. 19 -- that was available to us that wasn't Α. 20 available to other dealers, is that your question? 21 Yes. Q. 22 Α. Okay. In this environment, I can't. I had access to program data that was in force during the 24 time frame, I could probably identify it. I mean, there

25 were programs that were available to us as well as every

00090

21

22

programs that were made available to us by the fact that we could liquidate our position in those cars, as I stated 4 before. Was it told to me directly by Pat Letart? Directly and indirectly, he alluded to specific monies that we had available to us, and Jerry Mullins, in the same meetings, 7 would say, you know, this was in our 25 percent meetings that I referred to before. The only time he would get involved in it would be in situations where we had extra 10 cars available to us, you know. What he wanted, my superior 11 wanted, to do was to protect the dealer group from becoming 12 overburdened with inventory. 13 In other words, my view, as a professional, was going to be that I'll take all I can get. You know, if I've got room for them, and we were running out 15 of room, I'd still take the cars. The theory in the 17 automobile business that volume, or excuse me, inventory 18 creates selling pressure. I think that is to say that the more inventory you have, the more likely you are to take a

other dealer on the planet, and then we had additional

So I hope I've answered your question.

Q. Can you tell me of any specific

23 conversation where Pat Letart said to you we're giving you 24 money that's not available to other dealers to help you sell 25 excess inventory?

20 cheaper deal or to take a less profitable deal.

00091

7

- A. I can refer to it that that was a conversation that we had. Can I give you a specific time, date, time line, and a verbatim conversation, no. But I know that we had that conversation and that these monies were available. But can I give you a specific time, no, because it was not impactful to my life. It was not a milestone that I can recall.
- 8 Q. Can you give me a year in which that 9 occurred?
- 10 A. I can, outside of this. You know, I can 11 go back and reflect and maybe review my Excel spreadsheet or 12 something that I may have. You know, I don't know what it 13 has. It's not something that I look at. It's not a -- but 14 I may be able to do that. I cannot right now.
- Q. So you can't tell me any of the words that he used when he said that to you?
- A. Can you remember what somebody said to
 you two years ago, verbatim? No, nobody can. What I said
 was, in general, what happened, you know, and what was said,
 in general terms. I can't -- can I speak to verbatim? No,
 no more than you could to what, you know, one of your
 parents said to you five years ago. You can't, you can't do
 that.
- Q. Can you tell me in regard to which program that comment was made?

00092 The comment was made about a program with Lincolns and Grand Marquis, specifically. And as I referred to before, it could have been, I don't recall, but it could have been Mountaineers. 5 Do you know how much money was involved Q. 6 with it? 7 With the Lincoln, I know it was another 8 \$1,000 per car. That was the number that was bandied about 9 and that was the number that we would get a check for. 10 And how that check was distributed, how 11 it was funneled, how it was channeled down through the 12 organization, all I know is I would set up a receivable for 1,000 bucks from Ford Motor Company, which I couldn't claim via the on-line, you know, program. But when the office manager would come to me, as I specifically said, and said, "what do we do with these monies," she wouldn't do that 17 because -- or she would do it on that because she wouldn't 18 have a report in that specific dealer jacket about, you know, where is this money coming from, you know. And I 20 didn't make it up, it was a -- it's monies that were, that's set up for us as a receivable, and how it's going to be funneled and channeled through there, I have no idea. And she would come to me for the money 24 in my -- you know, and we would have a check for X number of thousands of dollars, and, well, what do we do with it?

00093

5

6

Well, the GM really didn't know, so he's left to me to, you know, put it here or put it there. So I would set it up as a receivable, and then, hopefully, it got accounted for at month's end.

- Q. Whenever this thing happened with the Lincolns and the Grand Marquis, do you have any idea what Eastside's inventory was like at that time?
- 7 Eastside's inventory was like at that time? I did, because -- did I have an actual 8 9 number, no. But here is what I did know: I would call up 10 as a -- I want, as a professional manager, I want all the information available to me, so that I can distribute the information to the people that worked for me. So, I, personally, would call Eastside Lincoln Mercury and ask for a salesperson, and if it was Dale Snider or the other guy, I'd hang up. So I would call up, acting like a customer, and find out what inventory they have. I would pretend as 17 if I was a customer and quiz them about the 10,000 off, what 18 is it off of. Well, it's just on this car or it's on that car. So I'm going to take the data that I received from them, and then I'm going to formulate a training session 21 based on the data that I'd got from that organization. As I said, if I call up and it's one of the guys that I know, obviously I'm going to hang up. They're going to recognize 24 my voice. But an inexperienced salesperson, I can grill

25 them pretty good. So I find out their inventory by calling

00094 them. I'm not going to get it from Lincoln Mercury. I'm sure that's something they don't share. I don't know, I don't think they do. But it's easy to call up and find out what other dealers have in stock. So you would actually call Eastside Q. 6 Lincoln Mercury at the time that you were getting this 7 special program, to find out how much they had at that time? 8 To find out what kind of inventory they 9 had, yeah. And then I would have a sales meeting and report 10 to my troops, as I call them. I'd say, hey, you know, we've 70 Lincoln, 150 available to us throughout the organization, and they have five or ten, or whatever the number is. I'm speculating. They're advertising them for ten grand off, but it's not ten grand off MSRP, it's ten grand off inclusive of rebates, inclusive of additions they've made to the car, you know, maybe they put a roof on for 1500 bucks, 17 you know, and maybe it cost them 500 to do it, whatever. 18 Do you recall how many Town Cars or Q. 19 Grand Marquis Eastside had at the time that you got this 20 special program to sell down excess inventory? 21 Relative to our inventory, I can speak Α. 22 to that, would that do? 23 Q. That will help me. 2.4 Α. Relative to our inventory, I would say 25 it would probably be 20 percent of our inventory.

00095 MS. MCNELLIE: Give me a minute, I may 2 be done. 3 (THEREUPON, A SHORT RECESS WAS TAKEN). 4 Other than Pat Letart, is there anyone Ο. else from Ford or Lincoln Mercury that had anything else to do with your affidavit? 6 7 Α. 8 MS. MCNELLIE: That's all the questions 9 I have, thank you. 10 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 11 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 12 BY MR. FLEMER: 13 Do you have a specific -- I'm going to Q. 14 follow-up on that last question and a couple of other items. 15 But do you have a specific recollection of never talking to Matt Wilson about any of these? Matt would have been the 17 general zone manager and then Pat would have reported to 18 him, during some segment of time. 19 A. I, when I saw that name, Matt Wilson, in 20 this, I don't know who he is. I've never had any contact 21 with him. I really didn't recognize the name. 22 Q. All right. 23 Α. In fact, it may have been someone else. 24 I don't know how he had been there, but I never had a lot of

25 conversation with him.

00096 Okay. And were there any of the Ford reps that would come to the dealership with Mr. Letart, do 3 you remember? On occasion, they would have interns, I Α. 5 quess, maybe, but that was very rare. Jerry Carter would be 6 very rare. You know, maybe, on occasion, a parts and 7 service guy would accompany a sales guy. You know, there 8 again, that would be very infrequent. So that's about 9 the --10 Q. Okay. During your tenure with Northgate 11 Lincoln Mercury, was your store ever audited by Ford? 12 A warranty audit or financial audit 13 or --14 A warranty based audit. 15 Α. You know, it seems that we were, but I 16 really can't recall. I can't recall right now. I mean, I 17 wasn't involved in it. I was a general sales manager, which is self-explanatory. I was involved mainly in the sales, general sales of the store, and not so much with the service 20 operation, so I couldn't address that. 21 Q. Okay. You don't recall any specific 22 time frame when the store was in a state of upheaval because 23 there was a warranty audit being conducted; is that right? MS. MCNELLIE: I'll object to the form. 25 I'm just making a record.

00097 I can't object to any point in time that we were in a state of upheaval, it really wasn't. You know, 3 we pretty much controlled the environment. Q. So if there was an audit going on, it 5 wouldn't have even been upsetting enough for you to hear 6 about it; is that right? 7 A. I may be -- you know, I would be made aware of it, but I don't really recall any specific time 8 9 that I was impacted by a warranty audit. 10 Okay. Q. 11 And really, I don't know if it existed, Α. 12 actually. You know, I heard whisperings of a warranty 13 audit. I don't know if they were threatened or they were real or they were imagined or what. I mean, you would hear that phrase, you know, tossed about every now and then, 15 16 but --17 Okay. You were testifying earlier about Q. 18 strategies that you employed to help your salespeople deal with issues surrounding Eastside Lincoln Mercury's pricing 20 structure. 21 Uh-huh. Α. 22 And I just wanted to get some Q. 23 clarification on how these strategies came into existence. 24 Were they things that you would think to do in discussing

25 the situation with Jerry Mullins, would you work

00098

5

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

collaboratively with him to come up with things to tell your salespeople, who could, in turn, respond to customer's queries about, well, they're selling a car for \$5,000 off, what are you going to do for us?

A. On occasion, we would work together to address, you know, other dealer's advertising. And we addressed Eastside's advertising specifically. And we had a meeting, although the focus of the meeting may not be, that might not have been on the top of the agenda, you know, but obviously it came up during the meeting. We would have a meeting and we'd address sales issues, and, you know --

- Q. When you say "we" --
- A. We, Jerry Mullins and I.
- Q. Jerry and you. And anyone else?
- A. Well, Randy Pelphery was a, you know, a

16 sales manager for me, a used car sales manager, and, you 17 know, we would formulate a strategy. I mean, I obviously

- 18 would, being the experienced one of the bunch, would offer
- 19 my ideas of, hey, here's how we combat it, what do you
- 20 think, let's get some feedback, you know. So I would offer
- 21 word tracts and so forth to combat the advertising. And it
- 22 really wasn't, you know, it wasn't a really hard obstacle to
- 23 overcome. You can advertise for, you know, we joked about
- 24 it, but let them go ahead and advertise ten grand off, you
- 25 know, I can overcome it in a heartbeat (snapping fingers).

00099

It doesn't matter. Will we lose a sale on it, yeah, we'll lose a couple, but we know we'll get most of them.

Q. And was this process you've described about having these meetings with Jerry Mullins and the used car sales manager from time to time, is that kind of ongoing, or was there a period of time when it began and a period of time when that effort ended?

7 period of time when that effort ended? 8 Α. We would have, you know, we would have 9 impromptu meetings, just whenever time was available. I 10 would go in and we would have a little, just a conversation, 11 not necessarily a meeting, but a conversation that I may even strike up, hey, here's what we're doing, you know, give me some input back, what do you think. Yeah, that's a good idea, yeah, that's a bad idea. I mean, we'd have a little brainstorming session. So we would have impromptu meetings as well as just conversations about it, you know, how do we 17 address it. Not just that but also with our other 18 franchises, you know, with Volkswagen or with -- you know, that was just one of the issues that we're addressing here. 20 I mean, there was many times that we'd have conversations 21 about how do we handle, you know, how do we address the trade-in issue, you know, how do we address that, what kind 23 of word tract can we have to -- I'm not getting enough on my 24 trade, how do you handle that, and I would offer -- and my

job was to train and motivate the sales staff. And on a

00100

5

6

7

weekly basis, I would chair a meeting with, you know, eight, ten seasoned sales veterans and two or three managers, and tell them what our strategy was.

- Q. Were there times when you took the strategy that you devised for your store at Northgate and shared it with Kings and shared it with Fairfield, those stores?
- 8 Α. Even though we were under the same 9 umbrella, there's an intense competition of jealousies, 10 envies, whatever words you want to inject here, with respect 11 to our performances. The organizations would publish a ten-day sales report within the organization, listing the performances of each individual store, vis-a-vis the previous year's sales data. So, when I had a meeting, if I had a ten-day report, I would demonstrate that to the others and say here's where we stand up in relation to our other 17 stores. So, you know, that was a frequent meeting that I 18 had. We were goal oriented, and our goal was to be the No. 1 Lincoln Mercury dealer in the city, regardless of our 20 relationship with, you know, our umbrella stores. Did I 21 want to beat the other stores? Damn right. In fact, there 22 were a lot of jealousies and a lot of animosity between that store and us because the general manager from the store that 24 I ran was promoted to the mother ship, you know, and then I 25 knew, and it was told to me, that I was stepping on toes

00101 within the organization. You know, you're doing this or you're doing that. Hey, I'm just trying to be No. 1. So if somebody gets offended, screw them. I can't help that. I'm not going to be a patsy to corporate politics. No, not me, I'm not going to do that. When you were referring to the general 6 Ο. 7 manager being promoted to the mother ship, you're talking 8 about Larry Feldhaus? 9 Α. Larry Feldhaus was the previous general 10 manager and --11 At Northgate? Q. 12 Α. 13 -- and I had indirectly insulted him within some meetings about their past performance. 14 15 Now, we're doing, when we took over the 16 store -- I don't say me, it wasn't just me, it was a team, a 17 collaborative effort from the team. And what we did, we 18 went from 80 cars a month, which they were happy with, to over 250 cars a month at our apex, new, used, Volkswagen, 20 Lincoln, Mercury and all. And then we started outselling 21 the other store. Now, all these little petty jealousies 22 started. You know, they're not going to give you this car, 23 we're not going to trade with you here, and then he would 24 call up to speak with me about what seemingly was a dealer

25 trade, but he wanted to let me know, you know, in no

00102 uncertain terms, that I'm a shareholder in this organization and you'll follow my line, boy. In other correspondence that I've had 4 with people in the organization, I refer to a lot of the issues that the company had out of anger, out of whatever, you know, that were other issues that the company had that, 7 you know, when I talked about Mr. Reichert had threatened me verbally, it was more of a reference to the previous correspondence that he and I and others had had within the 10 organization, not this issue here (indicating). 11 Okay. On the Gentry Shop sales contest, Q. 12 you've testified about it at some length, but did you know 13 there was a sales contest whereby there was going to be an 14 opportunity to go get clothes at Gentry before it happened, or were you informed after the fact that, hey, your store just won a contest among the three Kenwood Dealer Lincoln 17 Mercury stores, and as a result, you get to go shop at 18 Gentry, which way was it, if you remember? 19 Well, yeah, my recollection of it is Α. 20 this: We were allocated a certain amount of funds. 21 Q. Okay. 22 Α. Through Pat Letart and Jerry Mullins'

meetings that they had, I can't, you know, speak to them

24 specifically, but Jerry Mullins and, you know, Pat Letart

25 had got together and devised this particular contest. This

00103

12

13

15

16

wasn't a contest that came about with Lincoln Mercury or from Mr. Reichert or anybody else. This was a contest that these two had kind of gotten together, and my knowledge was that we had allocated a certain amount of funds to, you know, what do you want to do with the money? Well, do we want to make it a trip to Cancun or do we want to do this? Well, this was the pick of my superior, to do it this way.

- Q. Okay. So someone advised Mr. Mullins, Jerry Mullins, that there was money to help your dealership with, what should we do with it, and he and Pat, if I'm understanding you correctly, --
 - A. That's exactly what I'm saying.
 - Q. -- he and Pat took the amount that there was to work with and said, well, let's turn it into a sales contest between our three dealerships?
 - A. As far as I know, that's it.
- Q. And the payoff would be that the highest producing salespeople will get to go, the company with the highest producing salespeople gets to take their folks to shop at Gentry on Ford's tab; is that accurate?
- 21 A. That's accurate. And I have no
- 22 knowledge of -- it was Pat Letart and Jerry. And I know
- 23 this, that, you know, I could be given information by Jerry
- 24 Mullins that, I mean, it could have been all bullshit, but I
- 25 was -- it was told to me, exactly, that that's what

```
00104
    1
      happened. And can I prove that --
                      Q.
                           That's what Jerry told you?
    3
                     Α.
                           Can I prove it? No. There's no
   4
      documentation of that but --
   5
                     Q.
                          If he told you and you're testifying to
   6
      it, then that's your proof.
   7
                          Yeah, that's the only thing I can do, is
                     Α.
   8
      offer up what I believe is true.
   9
                      Q.
                          Right. And I think my other question in
  10
      this regard was: Did you know before the contest -- I mean,
  11
      I assume the contest had a start date and a close date, some
  12
      time frame within which to track sales; is that right?
  13
                           Right.
                     Α.
  14
                           But did you know before the fact that
                      Q.
  15
      the contest was going to run for a certain period of time,
      or was it not until after a period of time when somebody
  17
      said, hey, by the way, your store won this contest?
  18
                           I think the contest was premeditated,
                     Α.
  19
      you know, here's what we're going to do. We've got funds
      and these two got together and devised a little program.
      had X amount of dollars and it's going to run from this
  21
  22
      point to that point.
                          Do you remember how long it ran, was it
                      Q.
  24 two weeks or --
  25
```

It seems to me like it was a month and a

Α.

00105 1 half, maybe. Q. Okay. Maybe six weeks? 3 Α. Yeah. And some of the stuff, as it was referred to, that I took with me, that wasn't part of it. I 4 mean, that wasn't stuff that I would have any use for, you 6 know. 7 So you don't have any records that would Q. 8 verify what the time frame was on this? 9 Α. No. 10 Okay. Do you know how much money was Q. 11 put aside to be spent in this fashion, how much money Ford 12 was making available to the Kenwood Dealer Group? 13 I can only guesstimate, you know. Α. 14 don't really think that the general manager, as far as I knew, got any monies. It was just for the sales staff. I 15 know I was allocated, like I could spend \$500, I think, if I 17 recall. The whole deal was like, it was a good contest, we 18 won, but it was a bit of a sour taste in our mouth because it was like, you know, you're going retail. I mean, would I 20 spend my \$500 at a Gentry Shop at a retail level? You know, 21 did I get a 1099 for it? If I did, I probably didn't report it. I don't know that I did. I don't recall getting a 1099 from the factory about that, but he says --23 2.4 Q. What do you think the amount was, in the 25 aggregate, that was put aside?

00106

5

6

- Well, we had eight salespeople at 250 a pop, thereabouts, and two managers at 500 and 300, for me and the other guy, respectively. And the other guy, I think, was Randy Pelphery. So whatever that totals to be. So you had 500 put aside for you and
- 7 I had a store credit for 500 and I think 8 Randy had one for 300, and I think the salespeople each the 9 had 250, and there was approximately eight. So, you know, 10 it would be a couple thousand for the salespeople, so 2800 bucks I guess, I don't know, something like that. Like I said, I've never seen the bill. We never got a bill, per 13 se. We got a store credit.
- 14 Were there any other contests similar to Q. 15 this, where the genesis of it was that Ford had money that they wanted to supply to the Kenwood Dealer Group, and then 17 figure out a way and make it happen?
- 18 You know, after doing this, and, you Α. 19 know, trying to reflect a little bit and see if there was, I really couldn't address a specific instance that we did. You know, we would go out on the town, if you will, to
- 22 specific restaurants and have dinner. Was that funded by 23 Lincoln Mercury or our dealership? I don't really know.
- 24 the answer would be that I don't know. I don't think so,
- 25 but I don't know.

Randy had 300?

00107 When you're describing these scenarios of going out on the town for a dinner, who would go, would it just be your sales department or would it be --The sales department, the general Α. 5 manager, Jerry Mullins, and the wives or fiances of a few. On a couple of occasions, the management team was taken out. 7 And was that by Ford? I don't really think so, but I don't 8 know. 9 Q. When the sales department and the 10 general manager and their spouses would go, would we be 11 talking about a group of 20 people? 12 Α. Yeah. 13 Q. Roughly? 14 Yeah. Α. 15 One time we went to the LaNormandie Club, and another time we went with the prior, we went to a 17 dinner with the prior factory rep. His name was John Ogden, 18 I think. He went out to Utah or somewhere. And it was a 19 bit uncomfortable because he was the only one that was not 20 drinking, him and his wife, and everyone else had a casual 21 social drink, and you felt like you didn't want to drink in 22 front of this guy, out of respect to him. Q. Were the dinners that you've described 24 here, Mr. Mullins, in conjunction with some type of sales 25 promotion or event?

```
00108
                     Α.
                           I couldn't speak to that, really. If I
      had to answer that point blank -- well, I really can't
    3
      answer it.
   4
                     Q.
                          Okay.
   5
                          It could have possibly been, but I don't
                     Α.
   6
      know specifically.
   7
                     Q.
                          Okay.
   8
                     Α.
                          We were -- you know, you get all sorts
   9
      of little freebies here and there, but from the district.
  10 know we would get -- I don't know whatever happened to them,
      but I remember one specific instance that our general
      manager was trying to extract, from the district office, two
      or three golf school trips. And what the origin of those
      were, I don't know. But I was interested in it, being an
      avid golfer. So I was prodding my GM to, if he has any way
      of extracting those -- they were already bought and paid
  17
      for. Where they went, I have no knowledge, I can't address.
  18
      But I was interested in getting them, for personal reasons.
  19
                          And did they happen?
                     Q.
  20
                          I don't know. I don't know. I know
                     Α.
  21
      that they were -- I think --
  22
                     Q.
                          Jerry Mullins was trying to get that
  23
      worked out and you don't know if he ever did.
  2.4
                          Well, I know that he and Pat Letart took
                     Α.
  25 a trip to Florida that was, I don't know if it was business
```

00109 or if it was pleasure, but I know that they used up one of those trips. Jerry was -- he kind of bragged about it, you 3 know, I got this, I got that. Q. Was it for golf, is that what you're 5 referring to, or just --6 A. It was almost like a golf school. 7 don't really recall the name of it. That's all I can 8 address. I didn't get it, you know, so --9 Q. Do you remember when that was? 10 Α. (Shaking head negatively). You know, I 11 can't remember. I could probably investigate it and find out, but I don't really -- I don't know. I know that it's in my last couple of years of employment there, the last year and a half of my employment. That's about the best 15 time frame I could give. 16 I'm not a golfer. How long would one of Q. 17 these golf school sessions go, was it about a week or is 18 it --19 Well, three to five days. They have 20 schools that are available that are referred to as commuter trips, where you stay somewhere and commute back and forth. They have a trip where you can stay on the grounds and go to 23 their school or, you know, --2.4 And it was all expenses paid for Jerry? Q. 25 Α. As far as I know it was. He kind of

00110

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

15

bragged that it was this, that or the other. I don't really
know if -- Jerry was not a golfer, as such. I mean, he had
clubs and he had this and he had that. He didn't have a
game, I know that. I think it was just more of a getaway
type of thing.

Q. You also mentioned and were questioned to some extent about conversations where you were informed or learned that Ford's plan was to get Jim Dixon's store out of business, out of the way; is that right?

10 ${
m MS.}$ MCNELLIE: I'm going to object to 11 the form, but you can answer.

A. You need to restate it, if you would, please.

Q. Well, maybe I haven't stated it accurately, but I thought you testified earlier that there was a plan to help or to see that Jim Dixon's store got

17 closed and then sold to Bob Reichert?

18 A. Yeah, I had addressed before that the
19 goal of the consolidation of Lincoln Mercury stores was a
20 goal published by the factory. I mean, that, I think, is
21 pretty much common knowledge, that that was their agenda,
22 was to consolidate the stores, whether it be Ford or Lincoln
23 Mercury. And, you know, we were the chosen one, our dealer
24 group. And then, you know, we were going to try to acquire,
25 if Jim Dixon was to sell, you know, we would probably get

00111

25

candidate. So --

that store. And then if we could, you know, cause the same thing to happen with Eastside, then we could get that store. And then it was intimated to me that, Gene, you're going to be, you know, you're doing a great job, you excelled in this area, so my general manager would intimate to me that I had the possibility of getting one of 7 those stores. You know, my goal, I let my goals within the organization be well known, that my goal was to be a general 8 manager of one of the stores. And my general manager knew 10 it, you know. I felt he was threatened by it, for whatever 11 reason. I felt that Larry Feldhaus was threatened by, you know, he's going to come over here and do this, and his crew 13 is going to make us look bad again with Dixon. 14 And so, you know, after a couple of 15 passings in advancement, you know, I made some statements within the organization about, you know, I just wanted it to 17 be known, hey, will I have that position in the future with 18 the firm or am I -- if I'm to be ostracized from this crowd, let me know. I can live with it, but just let me know. So, the goal was to, hey, you know you are an integral part of the organization. If, in fact, we do consolidate, you know, if we do acquire these other stores, you'll be given a fair shot at the general managership, and based on your past 24 performance and skills, etcetera, that you would be a fine

00112 I took a note that it was stated in reference to Jim Dixon's store that Jerry Mullins had said "let's put the SOBs out of business." 3 4 Α. Right. 5 Ο. You remember him saying that in 6 reference to Jim Dixon? 7 Α. Yes, right. 8 Was a comment ever made along those Q. 9 lines about Eastside Lincoln Mercury? 10 I can't recall. I recall that specific Α. 11 comment. But to say that the same was said in a similar 12 fashion about Eastside, I can't honestly say that that 13 happened, no. It was intimated that if Eastside was like the last remaining holdout, if you will, in the 15 consolidation process, it was our view. And --16 The last non-KDG store standing, so to Q. 17 speak? 18 Within the, you know, greater 19 Cincinnati -- well, within the 275 loop, if you will, not 20 including Florence Lincoln Mercury, which was a non-entity 21 as far as we were concerned. It was a non-performing 22 agency. It was a mausoleum. They had many monikers 23 attached to that place because of its non-performance. 24 it really wasn't -- and who wanted it anyway. They had a, 25 you know, a ten or 15 million dollar facility with a high

00113

1 debt load and a sagging product line.

- Q. I don't know if you completed your earlier thought about Eastside being the last store that was really in competition with you, and you differentiated how it was different than Florence. Was there something else that you were going to --
- 7 A. No, other than the fact that, you know, 8 once they acquired Dixon Lincoln Mercury. And, you know, we get the sales reports supplied by the factory on the 10 performances of the other stores, you know, compared to ours and our group, not our group specifically but the group of 12 stores in the aggregate. We would get a sales report on a monthly basis, or even a mid-monthly basis, as to the monthly performance and then annual performance of the 15 stores. And we could see the deterioration of sales in the, you know, in Eastside, mostly as a result of, you know, the 17 dominance of Kenwood Dealer Group, one, and, you know, our 18 ultimate goal, it seemed, whether it was real or stated, was to be the dominant, the lone, singular Lincoln Mercury store 20 in the area.
- Q. From your tenure there in your position, was it your belief that Ford was helping that process go forward?
- A. That was my belief, that that was part of the process, given their attitude toward their

00114

7

8

10

11

12

13

15

17

advertising. It was my belief that that was the agenda, was to, you know, complete the consolidation of the stores. And once you enjoy that consolidation of stores, then you control the market. We controlled the market anyway, you know, but I guess they wanted to be Microsoftish, I guess, I don't know.

Well, I guess there are other various Q. levels of control, and if there's another dealership out there that you still have to compete with, then you don't have complete control; is that true?

In conversations with Mr. Feldhaus, that Α. once we acquired this -- if we were to acquire, once we acquired, whatever -- this last point of Lincoln Mercury, then we could price fix, almost.

14 You know, I mean, I would be chastised 16 from time to time about advertising, my advertising, and not so much by the factory but within our organization, that 18 what are you doing pricing these cars like that, why are you advertising a lease car like that. Well, hey, we're under the same umbrella, but I'm still in direct competition with them other stores, so that's why I'm advertising. And then ultimately, I was told by members of the organization to quit advertising like a freaking renegade, you know, tow the 24 line with respect to the company's advertising. And it

25 seemed to me that it was price fixing. That's what it was.

00115

7

8

10

11

I mean, you can call it anything you want, but the net result is, if three dealers in the area enjoy domination and you have meetings to control the amount of gross profit per sale, well, it's price fixing to me. You know, I bitched about it, but he's a renegade over there, I guess, I don't know.

Q. If I understand you, Mr. Mullins, you were corrected or chastised for pricing your vehicles at an amount or at amounts that were lower than what the other Kenwood Dealer Group Lincoln Mercury stores were using --

A. Right.

Q. -- and they felt that that was
Mr. Feldhaus, I think it was, who you attributed this
comment to -- felt that that was undercutting the company's
profitability?

23 organization, was trying to undercut our success. We had 24 that conversation numerous, numerous times. And that if I

25 persisted in my, I guess, style of management, then, you

00116 know, if you're not a company man, then you're going to be outside the company, was the intimation, or the statement. 3 Ο. And when you expressed those thoughts, 4 your viewpoint, to Mr. Mullins, what was his response? 5 A. Well, it was just like, you know, if 6 your goal is to be, you know, a general manager within this 7 organization, you need to go along with the programs, 8 whatever they are. 9 MR. FLEMER: Let's take a break for a 10 second. 11 (THEREUPON, A SHORT RECESS WAS TAKEN). 12 MR. FLEMER: Mr. Mullins, I don't have 13 any further questions. Thank you. 14 MR. HENGEHOLD: Nothing on my part. 15 MS. MCNELLIE: Nothing for me either. 16 Mr. Mullins, when we're done here, we're 17 going to probably ask this nice lady here to type up a copy 18 of this transcript for us. 19 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh. 20 MS. MCNELLIE: You have an opportunity, 21 as a witness, to be able to review it to make sure that she 22 has taken down what you said accurately, to make sure that 23 she hasn't gotten something you said that was wrong. Do you 24 want to exercise that right, or you can waive that right and 25 she can just type it up and send it to us?

00117	
1	THE WITNESS: No, I think it would be
2	prudent to look at it and make sure that the statements I
3	said are not misstated or misquoted or whatever.
4	That would not be now, would it?
5	MR. FLEMER: No, it will take her a
6	little while to get it typed up.
7	Can we all just agree among ourselves
8	that the court reporter can send the document directly to
9	Mr. Mullins, with instructions for the
10	MS. MCNELLIE: Object. No, I don't want
11	her to send it directly.
12	MR. HENGEHOLD: Well, then it's up to
13	her whether or not she releases the transcript.
14	MR. FLEMER: Or have him come in.
15	I think we've agreed that the court
16	reporter can send the original to Mr. Mullins for his review
17	and signature, unless you require him to come in to your
18	office.
19	
20	(MANUEL EUGENE MULLINS)
21	(DEPOSITION CONCLUDED)
22	
23	
24	
25	

```
00118
                         CERTIFICATE
      STATE OF OHIO
                                  SS
   3 COUNTY OF HAMILTON
           I, Jill M. Dragon Sandy, the undersigned, a duly
   5 qualified and commissioned notary public within and for the
   6 State of Ohio, do hereby certify that before the giving of
   7 his aforesaid deposition the said MANUEL EUGENE MULLINS, was
   8 by me first duly sworn to depose the truth, the whole truth,
   9 and nothing but the truth; that the foregoing is the
  10 deposition given at said time and place by the said MANUEL
  11 EUGENE MULLINS; that said deposition was taken in all
  12 respects pursuant to agreement as to time and place, that
  13 said deposition was taken by me in stenotypy and I am
  14 neither a relative of, nor attorney for, any of the parties
  15 to this cause, nor relative of nor employee of any of their
  16 counsel, and have no interest whatever in the result of the
  17
      action.
  18
        IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I hereunto set my hand and official
  19 seal of office, Cincinnati, Ohio this______day
  20 of______, 2003.
  21
  22
                   Jill M. Dragon Sandy-Notary Public
  23
                My commission expires: January 31, 2005.
  24
  25
```